

Relevant person	Investigation	Date decision notice was given	Commissioner's findings and determinations
<u>Welsh Ministers</u>	<p>The Commissioner received a complaint on 27/03/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that, on 26 March 2018, the complainant received an English only e-mail message in response to correspondence sent in Welsh on 2 March 2018. The e-mail message attached Welsh language correspondence from the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language¹ in response to the complainant's correspondence. The complainant provided a copy of the e-mail message which shows that an English only</p>	29/3/2019	<p>Commissioner's findings</p> <p>Standard 1: Standard 1 requires a body to respond in Welsh to Welsh language correspondence unless no reply is required, or that the person sending the correspondence in Welsh had indicated that there is no need to reply in Welsh. The complainant's allegation involved receiving an English only email message on 26 March 2018 in response to correspondence sent in Welsh to the Welsh Language Minister on 2 March 2018. The email involved and attached Welsh language correspondence from the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language. Having considered the information available to the Commissioner, the Commissioner believes that Welsh Ministers failed to comply with the requirements of standard 1 by sending a covering email, attaching a Welsh language response from the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language, in English only.</p> <p>Enforcement step CSG181: The enforcement action imposed on Welsh Ministers following investigation</p>

message was sent by the Welsh Government on 26 March 2018.

CSG181 required Welsh Ministers to ensure that they had adequate arrangements in place to comply with the standards regarding correspondence in relation to emails. The enforcement action also required Welsh Ministers to ensure that they monitored and reviewed those arrangements in order to ensure that they are effective. The enforcement action came into force on 12 September 2017, 28 days after receiving the decision notice. On 27 March 2018 a complaint was received alleging that, on 26 March 2018, the complainant received an email message in English only in response to correspondence sent in Welsh to the Welsh Language Minister on 2 March 2018. The email message involved and attached Welsh language correspondence from the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language. Having considered the information available to the Commissioner, the Commissioner believes that Welsh Ministers failed to comply with the requirements of the enforcement action imposed. This is because the arrangement in place for sending email correspondence at that time did not prevent a member of staff from sending an English only email to the complainant in response to Welsh language correspondence received by using the wrong email template. This resulted in Welsh Ministers failing to comply with the requirements of standard 1.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 1 and enforcement steps CSG181.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 1 and enforcement steps CSG181.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 – Advice in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Welsh Ministers should review the desk instructions issued to clerks in order to ensure that they are aware that they must respond in Welsh to Welsh language correspondence unless no reply is needed, or the person has indicated that there is no need to reply in Welsh.
2. Welsh Ministers should ensure that a covering email template for a final reply, provided to staff to use with correspondence, does not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English.

Enforcement action – Advice in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Welsh Ministers should ensure that templates provided to staff to use with correspondence do not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Welsh Ministers on 29/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Chief
Constable of

The Commissioner received a complaint on 21/06/2018 from a person which

27/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Dyfed-Powys
Police

satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to a telephone service provided by DriveTech, the company that delivers courses on behalf of the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police (Dyfed Powys Police), after a member of the public was caught not wearing a seatbelt whilst driving. The complainant alleged that he telephoned DriveTech's Welsh language line (0345 264605) to obtain information about courses. The call was not answered even though the complainant waited 20 minutes before abandoning the call. The complainant alleged that he telephoned the corresponding English language line (0345 264 6349) and that his call was answered immediately.

Standard 13: If a body provides a Welsh language service on one of its relevant telephone numbers, it must ensure that the telephone number for that Welsh language service is the same as for the corresponding English language service. This means that having a separate telephone number for a Welsh language service (which corresponds to the English language service) is not permitted. The Commissioner finds that the telephone service provided on behalf of the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police uses two different numbers to provide the Welsh language service and the corresponding English language service, contrary to the requirements of the standard. Standard 15: A body must ensure that performance indicators for dealing with telephone calls do not set measures which would treat telephone calls made in Welsh less favourably than calls made in English. The Commissioner finds that there is no evidence in this instance that performance indicators for dealing with telephone calls lead to telephone calls made in Welsh being treated less favourably than calls made in English.

Standard 17: According to the standard, when there is no Welsh language service available on a body's main telephone number (or numbers), or on any helpline numbers or call centre numbers, it must inform persons calling (by way of an automated message or otherwise) when a Welsh language service will be available. The Commissioner finds that on the date of the complaint the company providing the telephone service on behalf of the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police did not inform callers when a Welsh language service would be available.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police has failed to comply with standards 13 and 17 but does comply with standard 15.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police has failed to comply with standards 13 and 17.

Statement on the further action

Standard 13 – requirement to take action in accordance with section 77 (3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. The Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police must ensure that telephone numbers offering Welsh language services are the same as the telephone numbers for the English language services.

2. The Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police must provide written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that they have completed enforcement action 1

Timetable: Within 6 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police on 27/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Cardiff Council

The Commissioner received complaints on 17/01/2018 and 02/02/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaints met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and were therefore valid complaints. The complainants alleged that there were English only temporary signs on the pavement near Duke St on 16/01/2018 and other English only temporary signs on the corner of Penarth Rd and Taff Embankment in the Grangetown area on 01/02/2018.

22/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 61: Standard 61 requires the Council to ensure that any text on a sign (including a temporary sign) is displayed in Welsh. This could be on one sign or on a separate sign. The Commissioner received complaints from two members of the public regarding English only signs erected by contractors in two separate locations on behalf of Cardiff Council. The Commissioner has considered the Council and the complainants' evidence and is of the view that the Council had erected signs without Welsh language text, contrary to the requirements of the standard.

Enforcement Action CSG48 and CSG56: The enforcement action issued to the Council required the Council to take steps to ensure that any text displayed on temporary signs are displayed in Welsh (either on the same sign that displays the corresponding text in English or on a separate sign) and ensure that the Welsh text is treated no less favourably than English text if the text appears in both Welsh and English. The complaints received by members of the public raised doubts that the Council had not implemented the enforcement action. However, the Council provided evidence that it had included conditions within contracts that included checking specific bilingual signs before starting the work, using standardised bilingual signage and imposing penalties on contractors that erect signs that do not comply with the Welsh language standards. Therefore, the Council's evidence showed that Council had taken steps to ensure that any text displayed on temporary signs is displayed in Welsh and to ensure that the Welsh

text is treated no less favourably than English text if the text appears in both Welsh and English.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standard 61.

Statement of further action

No further action was taken on the basis that Cardiff Council has taken reasonable steps to try and ensure that no English-only signs are erected by contractors working on its behalf, I have decided to take no further action in this instance.

Statement on the further action

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Cardiff Council on 22/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Caerphilly
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 25/04/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant was unhappy that he did not receive a

22/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires the Council to answer Welsh language correspondence in Welsh if the person has not indicated that there is no need to reply in Welsh. The complainant sent an email to the Leader of the Council three times without receiving a response. The Commissioner's understanding is that the reason the complainant did not receive a response was because the Council had mistaken the correspondence for a

response to a Welsh language email sent to the Leader of the Council on 16/10/2017. He re-sent the email on 15/12/2017 and again on 12/03/2018 and 25/04/2018. The email asked the Council to respond to questions regarding Welsh-medium education.

newsletter or circular. The Commissioner believes that if the correspondence had been sent in English or bilingually the Council would have seen that it needed to respond to the correspondence. As the Council did not forward the correspondence for translation or to a Welsh speaker to read, it did not realise that a response was needed and the complainant did not receive a response to his correspondence. As the Council did not respond to the first three Welsh language emails the complainant sent to the Leader of the Council on 16/10/17, 15/12/17 and 12/03/18 the Council did not succeed in complying with standard 1 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Caerphilly County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 1.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Caerphilly County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 1.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. The Council must make arrangements to ensure that Welsh language correspondence received by the Leader of the Council's office is read by Welsh speakers or is translated.
2. A review of the Welsh language correspondence received must be undertaken.

3. Caerphilly County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that enforcement step 1 has been completed.

Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Caerphilly County Borough Council on 22/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 25/04/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant was unhappy that he did not receive a response to a Welsh language email sent to the Leader of the Council on 16/10/2017. He re-sent the email on 15/12/2017 and again on 12/03/2018 and 25/04/2018. The message was also sent to CustomerServices@flintshire.gov.uk. The email asked the Council to respond to questions regarding Welsh-medium education. The complainant alleges that he received an English language

22/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires the Council to answer Welsh language correspondence in Welsh if the person has not indicated that there is no need to reply in Welsh. In this case the complainant sent an email to the Leader of the Council on three occasions without receiving a response. On the fourth occasion he received a response in English. As the complainant did not receive a response to his Welsh language emails to the Council on three occasions, and as he received a response in English to a Welsh language email, the Commissioner does not believe that the Council has complied with standard 1 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Flintshire Council has failed to comply with standard 1.

Flintshire
County Council

response after sending Welsh language correspondence to the Council on 25/04/2018.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Flintshire Council has failed to comply with standard 1.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. The Council must conduct a review of the way it deals with Welsh correspondence sent to Council Cabinet members.

2. The Council must act on the findings of the review and take steps to address any weaknesses in order to ensure that Welsh correspondence is: - is read by a relevant person within the Council; - is translated, (if necessary) - and receives a response (if necessary) in line with the Council's corporate targets.

3. The Council must take steps to ensure that elected members and the officers who support them are aware of these arrangements.

Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Flintshire Council on 22/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 25/05/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3)

22/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 70: Standard 70 requires the Council to ensure that Welsh language text on a bilingual official notice is

to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleged that an official notice by Wrexham County Borough Council treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English. The official notice, in relation to a Public Consultation on Wrexham's Local Development Plan displays Welsh language text on the right side with the English on the left, and that the Welsh language heading is beneath the English heading.

positioned so that it is likely to be read first. Welsh language text would be likely to be read first usually if it is positioned on the left or above any corresponding English text, based on the standard practice of reading from left to right and from top to bottom. The Council published an official notice, which in this case, referred to a Public Consultation on Wrexham's Local Development Plan, displaying the Welsh language text on the right side with the English on the left, and placing the Welsh language heading beneath the English heading.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 70.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 70.

Statement on the further action

Standard 70 – Requirement for Wrexham County Borough Council to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must produce specific guidance regarding publishing and displaying public notices. The Council must draw staff's attention to the revised guidance and make it available to them.
2. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review of the current templates it uses for publishing and displaying official notices, and take steps to ensure that the text of each official notice that is in use positions the

Welsh text so that it is likely to be read first. This means that the Welsh must appear on the left and the Welsh heading must appear above the English heading.

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed the enforcement actions set out above.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 22/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 21/05/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint involved an English language letter dated 12 June 2018 from the Student Loans Company in relation to a loan deferment application. It was alleged that the letter stated that the Student Loans Company was not willing to accept evidence of the complainant's income in Welsh.

22/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires a body to answer correspondence in Welsh (if an answer is required), if it receives correspondence from a person in Welsh. A body is not required to do so in situations where a person has confirmed that there is no need for them to reply in Welsh. On 12 June 2018, SLC corresponded with the complainant via an English language letter in relation to an application to defer loan repayments. The letter noted that SLC was not willing to accept evidence relating to the complainant's income in Welsh, "Income evidence provided must be in English or accompanied with a translation". In considering the evidence received from the complainant and Welsh Ministers, the Commissioner believes that sending an English reply to Welsh language

Welsh Ministers

correspondence in this instance was in breach of the requirements of standard 1.

Standard 7: Where a body is required to comply with standard 7, they must state in correspondence, publications and official notices that invite persons to respond to them or to correspond with them, that they welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh, that they will respond to Correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. On 12 June 2018, SLC corresponded with the complainant via an English language letter in relation to an application to defer loan repayments. The letter did not state that SLC welcomed correspondence in Welsh. Instead, it stated “Income evidence provided must be in English or accompanied with a translation”. In considering the evidence received from the complainant and Welsh Ministers, the Commissioner believes that the response given in this instance was in breach of the requirements of standard 7.

Commissioner’s determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standards 1 and 7.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standards 1 and 7.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 If you receive correspondence from a person in Welsh you must reply in Welsh (if an answer is required), unless the person has indicated that there is no need to reply in Welsh. Imposition day: 30/03/2018
Standard 7 You must state - (a) in correspondence, and (b) in publications and official notices that invite persons to respond to you or to correspond with you, that you welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh, that you will respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. You must comply with standard 7 in every circumstance, except: ' where the correspondence, publication or official notice is sent outside Wales only. Imposition day: 30/03/2018

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Welsh Ministers on 22/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Cardiff Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 09/08/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the complainant had telephoned the trading standards service phone number for Cardiff Council ('the

22/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 10: When a person contacts the Council on its main telephone number (or numbers), or on any helpline numbers or call centre numbers, it must deal with the call in Welsh in its entirety if that is the person's wish (where necessary by transferring the call to a member of staff who is able to deal with the call in Welsh). The Commissioner has not been able to conclude whether the complainant selected the correct option to receive a Welsh language service during the first telephone call, due to a discrepancy in the evidence about which key

Council') on 0300 123 6696 at approximately 10:00 on 9 August 2018. He alleged that he pressed '#' to select the Welsh language service and that the telephone rang for several minutes unanswered. He alleged that he telephoned the number again immediately, selecting the English option. He alleged that a number of automated sub-options were offered when he selected the English option, which were not available when he selected the Welsh option. He alleged that he was answered immediately when using the English option and that the response was in English only. He noted that he did not receive a call back in Welsh, as was promised during the call, at the time he submitted his complaint.

applied at the time of the call. The Commissioner therefore is not been able to conclude that the Council failed to deal with the first telephone call in Welsh. The Commissioner concludes that the complainant telephoned the Council again and chose to select the option to receive an English language service from the Council rather than the Welsh language service. However, the Commissioner concludes that he later verbally expressed his wish to receive a service in Welsh. He received an English only telephone service and was promised a call back in Welsh. The Commissioner concludes that the Council failed to deal with the complainant in Welsh once it became aware that the complainant wished to receive a Welsh language service. The Commissioner also concludes that more automated options are available in English than in Welsh but that this does not necessarily mean that the Council would have failed to deal with a telephone call in Welsh in its entirety. Although this does not mean that the Council has failed to comply with standard 10, it does raise doubts about a failure to comply with standard 22, even though this is not covered by the terms of reference for this investigation. The complainant alleged that he was answered immediately after selecting the English option but was not answered at all after selecting the Welsh option. As the Commissioner has not been able to conclude whether the complainant selected the correct option during the first call, the Commissioner cannot conclude that this allegation is correct. Even if there was a way of proving this, the Commissioner does not believe that this in itself would mean that the Council has failed to deal with the call in Welsh in its entirety and, therefore, failed to comply with this standard.

Standard 17: When there is no Welsh language service available on a body's main telephone number (or numbers), or any helpline numbers or call centre numbers, the body must inform persons calling when a Welsh language service will be available. The Commissioner concludes that the complainant pressed '#' to try to receive a Welsh language service but that the telephone rang for several minutes unanswered. The Commissioner concludes that the complainant telephoned the Council again and chose to receive an English language service from the Council. He received an English only telephone service. The Commissioner concludes that a Welsh language service was available at the time of both calls in question but that the complainant, for different reasons, did not receive that service. In light of this, standard 17 would not have been applicable on this occasion.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standard 10 but has not failed to comply with standard 17.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standard 10.

Statement on the further action

Standard 10 – requirement to take action in accordance with section 77(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. The Council must conduct a review of its service on the 0300 1236696 telephone number, including the automated options.

2. On the basis of the review, the Council must ensure that it has (or any third party on its behalf) firm procedures in place to be able to deal with telephone calls to the 0300 1236696 number in Welsh in their entirety. This includes if the caller selects the English language telephone service initially but then changes their mind to receive a Welsh language telephone service.

3. The Council must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that enforcement action 1 and 2 have been completed.

Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Standard 17 – recommendation in accordance with section 76(3)(a) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. When there is no Welsh language service available on the telephone number 0300 1236696, the Council should ensure that there are adequate procedures in place to inform callers when a Welsh language service will be available.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Cardiff Council on 22/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Neath Port
Talbot County
Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 28/11/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The Commissioner received a complaint that the Council's social media Twitter accounts were in English only. The complainant referred to a number of accounts as examples of this.

14/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 58: Standard 58 requires the Council to ensure that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language when using social media. In order to comply with standard 58, the Council needs to ensure that any material that is in English on its social media accounts is also available in Welsh. The Council confirmed that the Twitter accounts referred to by the complainant, maintained by individual departments, are not available in Welsh. Therefore, the Council is treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in presenting information to the public on its Twitter accounts, therefore in this case, the Council does not comply with standard 58.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 58.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 58.

Statement on the further action

Requirement 1 Standard 58 – requirement to prepare an action plan in accordance with section 77(3) of the Welsh Language Measure. I require that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council draw up an action plan that will outline what steps the Council will take in order to comply with standard 58 when publishing departmental Twitter

accounts. For each step of the action plan the Council should note the staffing commitment required, what budgetary commitment will be required, a definite timetable and responsibility and accountability. I implement this requirement in accordance with section 80 of the Welsh Language Measure.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Requirement 2 Standard 58 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that the commitments in the action plan have been completed. The above is to be actioned within 20 days of the last date in the action plan.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council on 14/03/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham County Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 29/03/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the

4/3/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual

Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complaint was sent to me as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015. The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6. Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it. English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action. Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County

Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.

4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language

Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 28/06/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleged that he had contacted the Council on 26 June 2018 by telephoning 01437 764 551. Having chosen the Welsh language option, the complainant alleges that he had to wait 40 minutes before the call was answered. That answer was in English. When the complainant asked why the call was not answered in Welsh, the call handler replied that fewer people spoke Welsh in the County. The complainant also alleges that a colleague of his had contacted the Council on the

22/2/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 11: Standard 11 requires Pembrokeshire County Council to deal with calls in Welsh once it knows that the caller wishes to receive a Welsh language service over the telephone and only transferring the call to a member of staff to deal with the specific subject matter in English only where necessary. The complainant alleges that he waited for 40 minutes before receiving an answer in English having chosen the Welsh language option after telephoning the Council on 01437 764 551 on 26 June 2018. Following consideration of the evidence received by the Council, I am of the view that the Council did not deal with the call in question in Welsh once it became aware of the language wishes of the caller. Answering the call in the first place did not require any subject specific service and therefore the exceptions in sections (a) and (b) in standard 11 are not relevant in this situation. Standard 15: Standard 15 requires a body to ensure that performance indicators for dealing with telephone calls do not establish measures which would treat telephone calls made in

Pembrokeshire
County Council

same number, and having selected the English language option, received a response within minutes.

Welsh less favourably than calls made in English. The complainant alleges that he waited for 40 minutes before receiving an answer in English having chosen the Welsh language option after telephoning the Council on 01437 764 551 on 26 June 2018. The complainant also alleges that a colleague of his had contacted the Council on the same number, and having selected the English language option, received a reply within minutes. The Council cannot confirm whether the complainant's allegation that his colleague contacted the Council on the same telephone number selecting the English option and receiving an answer within minutes, is correct.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Pembrokeshire County Council has failed to comply with standard 11.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Pembrokeshire County Council has failed to comply with standard 11.

Statement on the further action

Standard 11 – Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Pembrokeshire County Council must make arrangements to deal with calls in Welsh in accordance with standard 11.
2. Pembrokeshire County Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action

1. Timetable: Within 30 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.
Standard 15 – Advice in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Pembrokeshire County Council should ensure that any performance indicators for dealing with telephone calls it may adopt, does not treat telephone calls made in Welsh less favourably than calls made in English.

2. I recommend that Pembrokeshire County Council makes arrangements for monitoring its performance in dealing with telephone calls and reports on its performance to an appropriate Council committee.

Timetable: Within 30 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Pembrokeshire County Council on 22/02/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Cardiff Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 21/03/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was regards the lack of availability of a Welsh language version of a survey (an online

22/2/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 50: Standard 50 requires bodies to ensure that each form it produces for public use is produced in Welsh. This includes any written forms, be they electronic or in paper form. Following full consideration of Council and complainant's evidence, the Commissioner finds that the Council has produced and published an electronic form for public use in English only on the date of the complaint.
Standard 58: Standard 58 requires that a body does not treat the Welsh Language any less favourably than the

form) that was promoted on Cardiff Council's Welsh language 'Twitter' account. The survey was being run on behalf of the Council by 'Sound Diplomacy' and was related to a project to create a 'Music City' for the city of Cardiff. The complainant also alleged, that this survey did not refer to the Welsh language, despite noting that the purpose of the survey indicated by the message on twitter promoting the survey, was to 'develop and protect the music industry of Cardiff'.

English Language when using social media. Following full consideration of the evidence of the Council and the complainant, the Commissioner finds that the Council provided a link to an English only survey on their Welsh language social media account and thereby treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language.

Standards 95, 96 and 97: These standards are a method of ensuring that any research work a body undertakes or commissions that is intended to assist it to make policy decisions; considers and deals in particular with effects that the decision would have on the Welsh language and opportunities for its use. Following full consideration of the evidence available to me, the Commissioner finds that the Council did no commission this Research work in accordance with the requirements of standards 95, 96 and 97.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standards 50, 58, 95, 96 and 97. Statement of further action Further Action was taken following the determination that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standards 50, 58, 95, 96 and 97.

Statement on the further action

Standard 50 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 (3) (3) of the Welsh Language Measure 1. Cardiff Council must ensure that its contracts with third parties includes clear clauses that commit the third party to comply with the requirements of the Welsh language

standards when delivering contact services to the public.

2. Cardiff Council must provide advice and guidance to staff on how to ensure that third parties that operate on its behalf comply with the Welsh language standards, this advice should give direction on how to include relevant clauses in contracts, considering the Commissioners advice document when doing so.

3. Cardiff Council must provide sufficient written evidence that demonstrates to the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has complied with enforcement steps 1 and 2.
Timetable: Within 60 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Standard 50 – advice in accordance with section 77 (4) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure. Cardiff Council should consider the need to develop arrangements for checking and approving any forms or online surveys that are shared by third parties on its behalf, before they are sent, in order to ensure that they comply with the requirements of the Welsh language standards.

Standard 58 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 (3) (3) of the Welsh Language Measure

4. Cardiff Council must develop arrangement to check its use of social media to ensure that it does not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. It should ensure that messages or Welsh language accounts do not provide links to material that is not in Welsh.

5. Cardiff Council must provide sufficient written evidence that demonstrates to the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has complied with enforcement step 4.
Timetable: Within 60 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

	<p>Standards 95,96 and 97 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 (3) (3) of the Welsh Language Measure</p> <p>6. Cardiff Council must develop processes and guidance , including arrangements for training staff, in order to ensure that research is commissioned in accordance with the requirements of the Welsh language standards.</p> <p>7. Cardiff Council must provide sufficient written evidence that demonstrates to the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has complied with enforcement step 6.</p> <p>Timetable: Within 60 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner’s final determination.</p> <p>Decision notice given</p> <p>The Decision Notice was given to Cardiff Council on 22/02/2019.</p> <p>Appeals made to the tribunal</p> <p>No appeal was made to the Tribunal.</p>
<p><u>Caerphilly County Borough Council</u></p> <p>The Commissioner received a complaint on 11/12/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleged that he sent Welsh medium correspondence to Caerphilly County Borough Council's Community Occupational Therapy team on 7 December 2017 via the electronic form on the Council's website (on the</p>	<p>24/1/2019</p> <p>Commissioner’s findings</p> <p>Standard 1: Standard 1 requires the Council to reply in Welsh if it receives correspondence from a person in Welsh (if an answer is required). In its evidence, the Council states that it replied to the correspondence on 22/12/2017. The Council has also explained that the reason for the delay in responding was that the appropriate officer from the Reablement Team was on leave and that the complainant refused the Council's offer for another Welsh speaker to deal with the enquiry. The Commissioner therefore concludes that the Council took the appropriate steps to respond to the complainant's enquiry in Welsh within a reasonable timescale but that</p>

'Contact Us' section / Council Services / Children and Families contacts). The complainant alleges that he has not received a response to the correspondence and claims that the reason is because he chose to correspond with the Council in Welsh. The complainant provided a link to the relevant page which also showed that the Welsh medium page had an English heading, 'Information, Advice and Assistance (IAA) for Children's Social Services'.

the complainant refused the service offered. Standard 52: Standard 52 requires the Council to ensure that the text of every page of its website is available in Welsh. The Council acknowledges that the heading 'Information, Advice and Assistance (IAA) for Children's Social Services' appeared in English on the website's Welsh language page in December 2017.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Caerphilly County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 52.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Caerphilly County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 52.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – requirement to take action in accordance with section 52 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Caerphilly County Borough Council must undertake a review of its website to ensure that the text of every page of the website is available in Welsh in accordance with the requirements of standard 52.

Timetable: Within 24 weeks from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination

2. Caerphilly County Borough Council must take steps to ensure that staff responsible for the website's content are aware of the requirements of standard 52.

Timetable: Within 12 weeks from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination

3. Caerphilly County Borough Council must prepare and provide guidelines for staff responsible for loading and monitoring website content in order to ensure compliance with standard 52.

Timetable: Within 12 weeks from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination

4. Caerphilly County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1 – 3.

Timetable: Within 24 weeks from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Caerphilly County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

The Commissioner received a complaint on 07/12/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to the City and County of Swansea Council's (the Council) use of the Welsh language on a self service payment machine and in correspondence. The complainant said

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: When the Council receives correspondence in Welsh, and the Council is required to reply to that correspondence, it must reply in Welsh unless the person sending the correspondence has indicated that there is no need to do so. The complainant sent correspondence to the Council in Welsh. He did not say that the Council did not need to respond in Welsh. The Council's response came in the form of a letter written in Welsh, but the e-mail presenting the response was written in English. I consider the e-mail to be part of the Council's response;

City and County
of Swansea
Council

that the payment machine for parking tickets near Tŷ Tawe in Swansea gives priority to the English language as a button must be pressed in order to receive instructions in Welsh. He sent photographs of the self service machine to me as evidence to support his complaint. The complainant explained that he had complained to the Council about the self service machine and sent a copy of his complaint to me. The evidence showed that the complainant had sent an e-mail to contact@swansea.gov.uk on 30 January 2018. The e-mail was written in Welsh. It outlined his complaint about the self service machine and attached were two photographs of the machine in question showing text in English only. On 23 February 2018 the Council responded to the complaint. According to the complainant's evidence, the e-mail which presented the Parking Services Manager's response to the complaint was written in English. It said: Good Afternoon Please find attached response to your email. Cofion/Regards

therefore it should have been in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 1.

Standard 7: The Council must include a statement in correspondence that it welcomes correspondence in Welsh, and that it will respond in Welsh to Welsh language correspondence and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. The Council sent correspondence, in the form of a letter, to the complainant which did not include such a statement. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 7.

Standard 60: The Council must ensure that all of its self service machines (1) function fully in Welsh, and (2) that they treat the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language. In considering the evidence I received from the complainant and the Council, I believe that the Council has treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language by setting English as the default language on a self service payment machine for parking tickets. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 60.

Compliance with Enforcement Steps: Standard 1: The enforcement action required the Council to ensure that it replied in Welsh to any correspondence which was written in Welsh and required a reply by 13 December 2017. It was relevant to any correspondence sent to the Council. On 23 February 2018, a member of staff at the Council sent a letter written in Welsh in response to Welsh language correspondence from the complainant, but the e-mail presenting the response was written in English. Sending an e-mail written in English was a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Standard 7: The enforcement action requires the Council to state in correspondence that it welcomes correspondence in Welsh, that it will respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay in order to comply with the requirements of standard 7. The evidence showed that the Council had sent a letter to the complainant which did not include such a statement. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Swansea City and Town Council has failed to comply with standards 1, 7 and 60 and the enforcement steps given during a previous investigation.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Swansea City and Town Council has failed to comply with standards 1, 7 and 60 and the enforcement steps given during a previous investigation.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 – Requirement to take action in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure 1. The Council must take action to establish a formal process to receive and respond to correspondence in accordance with the requirements of standard 1, and produce staff guidance on that process. Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's determination.

Standard 7 – Requirement to take action in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. The Council must adopt and publish a statement which meets the requirements of standard 7 in its correspondence (and its publications and official notices that invite persons to respond or send correspondence).

Standard 7 – Advice in accordance with section 77(4)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. The Council should consider the prominence of the statement at the bottom of e-mails which it sends in accordance with standard 7.

4. The Council must provide sufficient written evidence that enforcement actions 1-3 have been completed.

Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's determination.

Standard 60 – Requirement to take action in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

5. The Council must ensure that all self service machines for which it is responsible either offer an equal language choice between Welsh and English on the front screen, or preset the Welsh language as the default choice on machines.

6. The Council must provide sufficient written evidence that enforcement action 5 has been completed.

Timetable: Within 6 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Swansea City and Town Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 07/12/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complainant alleged that the notice did not comply with the Welsh language standards in a number of ways, and outlined the following as examples:

- a number of sections in English only;
- English in bold and in a bigger font than the Welsh;
- the English appearing before the Welsh.

The complainant explained that they had complained to the Council about the Council Tax Demand Notice on several occasions from 2014 onwards.

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6.

Enforcement Action CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it. English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Enforcement Action CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure
2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

			<p>Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.</p> <p>Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure</p> <p>3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.</p> <p>4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.</p> <p>Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.</p> <p>Decision notice given</p> <p>The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.</p> <p>Appeals made to the tribunal</p> <p>No appeal was made to the Tribunal.</p>
<p><u>Wrexham County Borough Council</u></p>	<p>The Commissioner received a complaint on 29/03/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for</p>	<p>24/1/2019</p>	<p>Commissioner's findings</p> <p>Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice</p>

2018/19. The complaint was sent to me as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015. The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6.

Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it. English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County

Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination. Investigation CSG172 enforcement

action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.

4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions

1, 2 and 3. Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 29/03/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complaint was sent to me as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015.

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6. Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action. Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh Language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure
1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with

standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.

4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 30/03/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complaint was sent to me as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015. The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6.

Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it. English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax

department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.

4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Wrexham County Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 09/04/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complaint was sent to me

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding

as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015. The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6.

Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it. English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.

4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 08/04/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complaint was sent to me as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015.

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6. Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action. Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh Language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure
1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with

standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.

4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 10/04/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was about Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. The complaint was sent to me as a copy of an email which was addressed to the Council's Leader. In the email to the Leader, the complainant alleged that the Council Tax Demand Notice treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language in several ways. The complainant claimed that the Council was made aware of mistakes in the Council Tax Demand Notice in 2014 and that a complaint had been made about the matter in 2015. The complainant also alleged that the Council had disregarded the standards placed upon it by me, and had ignored instructions issued by the Ombudsman for Wales in relation to the Council Tax Demand Notice. The complainant explained that he would not pay his council tax bill until a corrected Council Tax Demand Notice was issued to him by 14 April, 2018.

24/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires the Council to ensure, when producing corresponding Welsh and English language versions of correspondence, that it does not treat the Welsh language version less favourably than the English language version. The Council produced correspondence, in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice, which treated the Welsh version less favourably than the English version in terms of its visual presentation. The Welsh language text in the notice appeared less prominently than the corresponding English text, and there were a number of examples within the notice of text that was missing in Welsh. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with standard 6.

Enforcement Step CSG172: The enforcement action requires the Council to ensure that any English text in correspondence is also sent in Welsh. The Council is also required to ensure that the text is proofread in order to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than an English language version. This is relevant to any correspondence sent by the Council, whichever department is responsible for producing it. English text was sent in correspondence - in this case a Council Tax Demand Notice - without corresponding Welsh text. The notice was not proofread in a way that identified that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language in terms of visual presentation. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Enforcement Step CSG233: The enforcement action requires the Council to take steps to ensure that there are no linguistic errors in Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council Tax

department. The Council did not take sufficient steps to ensure that no linguistic errors appeared in the Welsh language text of its Council Tax Demand Notice for 2018/19. This shows a failure by the Council to comply with the enforcement action.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6 and enforcement steps 172 and 233.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that every element of its Council Tax Demand complies with standard 6. Requirement to publicise in accordance with 77(3)(c) of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must give publicity to its failure to comply with standard 6 in relation to its Council Tax Demand. The Council should publish this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

			<p>Investigation CSG172 enforcement action: Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure</p> <p>3. Wrexham County Borough Council must conduct a review to ensure that it has sufficient arrangements for proofreading correspondence sent out publicly to a number of recipients.</p> <p>4. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1, 2 and 3.</p> <p>Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.</p> <p>Decision notice given The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 24/01/2019.</p> <p>Appeals made to the tribunal No appeal was made to the Tribunal.</p>
<p><u>City and County of Swansea Council</u></p>	<p>The Commissioner received a complaint on 15/11/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint relates to the Council's alleged failure to respond to Welsh language correspondence in Welsh. The complainant alleges that they</p>	<p>11/1/2019</p>	<p>Commissioner's findings Standard 1: Standard 1 requires the Council to reply in Welsh if it receives correspondence from a person in Welsh (if an answer is required). The enforcement action presented to the Council in light of investigation CSG201 requires the Council to respond in Welsh to all correspondence written in Welsh, if the correspondence requires a response. On 3 January and 10 January 2018, a Council officer corresponded in English only with a member of the public who had corresponded with the Council in Welsh.</p>

corresponded with a member of staff at the Council between 29 November 2017 and 14 January 2018. It is alleged that the member of staff responded in English to Welsh language correspondence on 3 January 2018 and 10 January 2018. The member of staff's e-mail did not state that the Council welcomes correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh would not lead to delay.

Standard 7: Standard 7 requires the Council to state in correspondence that it welcomes receiving correspondence in Welsh, that it will respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. The enforcement action presented to the Council in light of investigation CSG201 requires the Council to ensure that it states in correspondence that it welcomes correspondence in Welsh, that it will respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. The Council's initial e-mail to the complainant dated 29 November 2017 included the following statement at the bottom of the message: "We welcome correspondence in Welsh and will deal with Welsh and English correspondence to the same standards and timescales".

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Swansea City and Town Council has failed to comply with standard 1 and the requirement to take action in light of investigation CSG201.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standard 1 and the requirement to take action in light of investigation CSG201.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Swansea City and County Council must take steps to establish a formal process to receive and respond to correspondence in accordance with the requirements of standard 1, and produce staff guidance on that process.
2. Swansea City and County Council must remind / raise awareness of staff who receive and respond to correspondence of the arrangements and the guidance in place with regard to the processes for dealing with correspondence in accordance with the requirements of Standard 1.
3. Swansea City and County Council must make a formal apology to the complainant for failing to respect their language choice and failing to respond to the complaint in their e-mail dated 7 January 2018.
4. Swansea City and County Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1-3.

Timetable: Within 12 weeks from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Newport City Council on 11/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Glyndŵr
University

The Commissioner received a complaint on 11/05/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in

11/1/2019

Commissioner's findings

Standard 57: Standard 57 requires Glyndŵr University to ensure that any new or amended page on its website is available in Welsh, is fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably. After

section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint alleged that Glyndŵr University advertised posts on its website in English only. In addition, the complainant alleged that it was not possible to submit an application for the posts in Welsh. The complainant also alleged that the Welsh language service on the University's website was not adequate and added that the University's main Welsh language Twitter account posted fewer messages than the English language account; and that the Welsh language was therefore treated less favourably than the English language on this social media.

considering the evidence provided by the complainant and the University, the Commissioner concludes that Glyndŵr University published new pages on its website for the purpose of advertising posts, and that the pages were in English only for a period of time.

Standard 62: Standard 62 requires a body to ensure that it does not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language when using social media. The evidence provided by the complainant and the University confirms that the University published less content on its Welsh language account during May 2018 than it published on its corresponding English language account, and thus treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language.

Standard 145A: Standard 145A requires a body to specify Welsh language skills which have been assessed for every role in the advertisement, and whether there is a requirement for Welsh language skills. After considering the evidence provided by the University and the complainant, the Commissioner finds that the University advertised posts in English only in May 2018 even though Welsh language skills were specified for those posts.

Standard 146: Standard 146 requires Glyndŵr University to ensure that it states clearly in every job advertisement that Welsh language applications may be submitted and that an application submitted in Welsh will not be treated less favourably than an application submitted in English. The Commissioner finds that the University states in accordance with standard 146 that it is possible to apply in Welsh and that a Welsh language application will not be treated less favourable than an English language application.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Glyndŵr University has failed to comply with standards 57, 62, 145A and 146.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standards 57, 62, 145A and 146.

Statement on the further action

Standard 57 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Glyndŵr University must conduct a campaign to raise awareness amongst staff of the guidelines and policies it has in place to ensure that its website complies with the requirements of the Welsh language standards.

Timetable: Within 28 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

2. Glyndŵr University must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 1. Timetable: Within 90 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Standard 62 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Glyndŵr University must ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language when using social media. The University must ensure that the Welsh and English language content it publishes corresponds fully on social media which is

subject to the standard. Timetable: Within 28 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

4. Glyndŵr University must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 3.

Timetable: Within 90 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Standard 145A – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

5. Glyndŵr University must conduct a campaign to raise awareness amongst staff of the guidelines and policies it has in place to ensure that its website complies with the requirements of the Welsh language standards.

Timetable: Within 28 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

6. Glyndŵr University must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 5.

Timetable: Within 90 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Newport City Council on 11/01/2019.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Newport City Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 07/12/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3)

17/12/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 88, 89 and 90: The policy making standards require bodies to consider and note all relevant effects a

to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint outlined the complainant's concern regarding the consultation and decision taken by Newport City Council to open a new English medium school in the Glan Llyn area, Llanwern, Newport. In particular, the complainant noted that they were of the opinion that the 'Impact Assessment' completed by the Council during the consultation period did not fully consider how the decision to open the school effected the Welsh language, either positively or adversely. The impact assessment referred to was completed in September 2017.

policy decision could have on opportunities for people to use the Welsh language or to treat the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language. In order to do this, a body must consider relevant evidence in order to consider likely effects a policy decision would have on the Welsh Language. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public who alleged that the Council had not satisfactorily considered the possible effects on the Welsh language when completing impact assessments relating to a policy decision to open a new school. Following full consideration of the evidence of the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the Council has not implemented the requirements of standards 88, 89 and 90 when making its policy decision to open a new school. The Council has not considered what effects the decision could have on opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language or to not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. Neither has the Council considered how they could formulate the decision so that it could have more positive effects, or less adverse effects on opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language or to treat the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language.

Standards 91, 92 and 93: Standards 91,92 and 93 impose a requirement for a body's consultation documents relating to policy decisions, to consider and seek opinions from persons regards the possible effects that decision could have on the Welsh language and opportunities to use the language. Specific questions must be included in the consultation document that require a response. A

body should give due attention and consideration to the information collected during the process when making the policy decision, and implements any conclusions resulting from the consultation. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that the Council had not sufficiently sought the opinion of the public on the possible effects on the Welsh language when consulting on a decision to open a new school. Following full consideration of the evidence presented by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the Council has not implemented the requirements of standards 91,92 and 93 when consulting on the policy decision to open a new school. The Council did not seek opinions in the consultation document regards what effects the decision could have on opportunities to use the Welsh language. Neither did they ask how the decision could be made so that it could have more positive effects, or less adverse effects, on opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language, or to not treat the Welsh language any less favourably than the English language.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standards 88, 89, 90,91, 92 and 93.

Statement of further action

Further Action was taken following the determination that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standards 88, 89, 90, 91, 92 and 93.

Statement on the further action

Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 (3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Newport City Council must adopt a robust process for completing and recording consideration of any effects a policy decision could have on opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language and treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language. The process must include clear guidance for officers and councillors regarding how they should complete and record the relevant considerations.

Timetable: Within 90 days of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

2. Newport City Council must adopt a robust process for completing and recording considerations for how a policy decision could be formulated so that it can have positive effects on opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language and treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language. The process must include clear guidance for officers and councillors regarding how they should complete and record the relevant considerations.

Timetable: Within 90 days of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

3. Newport City Council must adopt a robust process for completing and recording considerations for how a policy decision could be formulated so that it can have less adverse effects on opportunities for persons to use the Welsh language and treating the Welsh language no less

favourably that the English language. The process must include clear guidance for officers and Councillors regards how they should complete and record the relevant considerations.

Timetable: Within 90 days of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. 4. Newport City Council must provide sufficient written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that enforcement steps 1, 2 and 3 have been completed.

Timetable: Within 110 days of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

5. Newport City Council must develop a series of standard questions to use in consultation documents that relate to policy decisions so that they seek opinions in line with the requirements of standards 91,92 and 93

6. Newport City Council must incorporate considerations on complying with the Welsh language standards into any consultation process it undertakes. Timetable: Within 90 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

7. Newport City Council must provide sufficient written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that enforcement steps 5 and 6 have been completed.

Timetable: Within 110 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Newport City Council on 17/12/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Neath Port
Talbot County
Borough Council

On 05/06/2017 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint was in relation to a pay and display machine in a car park owned by Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, located at Harbourside, Parkway, Port Talbot. It is claimed that the default language on the machine is English. It is claimed that it is necessary to press a button in order to receive a Welsh language service.

12/12/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 60: Standard 60 requires that any self service machine must function fully in Welsh, and the Welsh language must be treated no less favourably than the English language. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public claiming that the default language on the pay and display machine at the Harbourside car park in Port Talbot was English. The Council confirmed: "The machines' default language is indeed English; but the Welsh Language Service can be accessed at a press of a button." In consideration of the evidence received from the Council and the complainant, the Commissioner is of the view that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language, as the default language on the pay and display machine for which the Council is responsible, is English.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Neath Port-Talbot County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 60.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Neath Port-Talbot County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 60.

Statement on the further action

Standard 60 – requirement for Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council to take action in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011

□□ Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council must prepare an action plan that will show the steps taken to change the default language to Welsh in parking ticket machines which can accommodate an alternative language indicator (button). The action plan should include the following information: - The main stages of the process when planning the work - The timetable for completing the work (it should not exceed 12 months to complete the task) - The budget for completing the work -

The name of the person who has responsibility for the project
Timetable: The Council must prepare the draft action plan within 12 weeks of receiving the investigations' final report. I will act in accordance with section 80 of the Welsh Language Measure in relation to the action plan. □□ Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council must prepare an action plan that will show the steps taken to comply with standard 60 in relation to screens on the parking ticket machines which are too small to accommodate an alternative language indicator (button) these would be replaced within 3 years. The action plan should include the following information: - The main stages of the process when planning the work - The timetable for completing the work - The budget for completing the work - The name of the person who has responsibility for the project

Timetable: The Council must prepare the draft action plan within 12 weeks of receiving the investigations' final report. I will act in accordance

Newport City Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 25/04/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that Newport City Council's website is not fully functional in Welsh. The complainant alleged that they had clicked on 'C' under the 'A-Z of Services' on top of the Welsh homepage: <http://www.newport.gov.uk/cy/Hafan.aspx> and that this had led them to an English only page. They also allege that an English only pop-up survey had appeared on the Welsh pages.

12/12/2018

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Neath Port-Talbot County Borough Council on 12/12/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires a body to ensure that all pages on its website are available and are fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language on those pages. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public on 25 April 2018 alleging that clicking on 'C' under the 'A-Z of Services' on top of the Welsh homepage <http://www.newport.gov.uk/cy/Hafan.aspx> leads to an English only page. The complainant also alleged that a pop-up survey on the Council's website appeared in English only. After considering the evidence received, the Commissioner concludes that not all pages on the Council's website are available and fully functional in Welsh and the Council recognises this.

Standard 56: Standard 56 requires a body to ensure that the interface and menus on every page of its website are available in Welsh. The nature of interfaces and menus changes according to each individual website specifically, but they may be considered to include those parts of a website that do not show content but are part of the infrastructure and allow the user to communicate with a

programme. Menus can include options and lists to select from. The Commissioner received complaint from a member of the public on 25 April 2018 alleging that clicking on 'C' under the 'A-Z of Services' on top of the Welsh homepage

<http://www.newport.gov.uk/cy/Hafan.aspx> leads to an English only page. The complainant also alleged that a pop-up survey on the Council's website appeared in English only. After considering the evidence received, the Commissioner concludes that not all menus on the Council's website are available in Welsh.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standard 52 and 56.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken following the determination that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standard 52 and 56.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure
Enforcement action 1: Newport City Council must ensure the following in relation to its website: a) that every page is available in Welsh b) that links provided on Welsh language pages direct the user to information or documents in Welsh.

Enforcement action 2: Newport City Council must ensure that pop-up surveys do not treat the Welsh language less

favourably than the English language. The Council must ensure that users are given the option to respond to surveys in Welsh every time.

Enforcement action 3: Newport City Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions [1-2].

Standard 56 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure
Enforcement action 4: Newport City Council must provide every interface and menu on each page of your website in Welsh.

Enforcement action 5: Newport City Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 5.

Timetable: Within 90 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Newport City Council on 12/12/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Cardiff Council

On 14/05/2018 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a

10/12/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires a body to ensure that all pages on its website are available and are fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language on

valid complaint. The complainant claimed that on one of Cardiff Council's websites (www.keepingcardiffmoving.co.uk) Welsh pages were not available for the corresponding English pages. The complainant claimed that the 'Cymraeg' button at the top of each page led the user to pages that did not correspond to the English page.

those pages. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complainant claims that on one of the Council's websites (www.keepingcardiffmoving.co.uk) no Welsh page was available for the corresponding English page. After considering the evidence provided by both the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner concludes that there were pages where no Welsh was available on the website in question, and that the website was not fully functional in Welsh.

Standard 55: Standard 55 requires a body, if it has a Welsh language web page that corresponds to an English language web page, to state clearly on the English language web page that the page is also available in Welsh. It must also provide a direct link to the Welsh language page on the corresponding English language page. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complainant claimed that the 'Cymraeg' button at the top of each page led the user to pages that did not correspond to the English pages. After considering the evidence provided by both the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner concludes that although a 'Cymraeg' button informed the website user that there was a corresponding Welsh language page available, that link was not working correctly and led the user to pages that did not correspond to the English pages.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standard 52 and 55.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken following the determination that Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standards 52 and 55.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – advice in accordance with section 77(4)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure As City of Cardiff Council completes the work of recreating the website, it should ensure that it complies fully with the requirements of standard 52. The website should be checked and tested to ensure that it is fully functional in Welsh before it is published.

Standard 55 – advice in accordance with section 77(4)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure As City of Cardiff Council completes the work of recreating the website in question, it should ensure that it complies fully with the requirements of standard 55. Any use of links such as 'Cymraeg' buttons at the top of web pages should be checked and tested to ensure that they are fully functional in Welsh before the website it is published.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Cardiff Council on 10/12/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The National
Theatre of
Wales

On 23/11/2017 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleges that NTW treats the Welsh language less favourably than the English language by circulating its newsletter via email in English requiring those who wish to read the newsletter in Welsh to click on a link that directs readers to the information in Welsh on the organisation's website. The complainant submitted a copy of the newsletter entitled "What's New at NTW?"

6/12/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires a body to reply in Welsh to correspondence in Welsh. It appears that NTW did respond to the correspondence, although it did take 4 weeks to do so. There is no further interpretation within the regulations that detail what is considered a reasonable period within which an organisation is required to respond to correspondence. Therefore, I must consider the organisation's common practice or policies. NTW does not have an organisationally agreed specific timescale for responding to correspondence, but the evidence states that it can take 4 or more weeks to respond to correspondence. NTW acknowledged that it did not respond to the complainant's correspondence within a reasonable timescale in this instance. The complainant is of the view that the delay in NTW's reply to his email was due to the fact he had corresponded with NTW in Welsh. However, following evidence from NTW, there is nothing to suggest that the delay in replying was due to the language medium of the correspondence. NTW has confirmed that the correspondence had been received by the communications team that include two Welsh speaking members of staff. Therefore the Commissioner must accept NTW's position that it was human error that led to the delay in replying to the original email before 24 November 2017.

Standard 6 and 33: Standard 6 and standard 33 require a body to ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language when producing

correspondence and publicity material. On 26 October 2017 NTW distributed the the newsletter 'What's New at NTW?' via email to NTW subscribers that had an English only title, with the English version appearing in the body of the email with a link to the Welsh version. In publishing the newsletter 'What's New at NTW?' with an English only title and the English version of the newsletter included within the email, requiring the reader to click on a link to see the Welsh version, NTW treats the Welsh language less favourably than the English language.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that the National Theatre for Wales has not failed to comply with standard 1 in this case but has failed to comply with standards 6 and 33.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that the National Theatre for Wales has failed to comply with standards 6 and 33.

Statement on the further action

National Theatre Wales must take steps to ensure that the Welsh version of any newsletter produced and published by the organisation is treated no less favourably than the English version. National Theatre Wales must provide written evidence that shows that you have complied with enforcement steps 1. Timetable: Within 12 weeks of issuing the Commissioner's final determination

Flintshire
County Council

On 13/12/2017 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleges that the content of the 'Do it Online' page on Flintshire County Council's website (www.flintshire.gov.uk) is not available in Welsh in its entirety. The complainant refers specifically to 3 sections that appeared in English only on the 'Do it Online' webpage: 'Apply for it', 'Pay for it', and 'Report it'. A screenshot of the page in question was provided as part of the complaint. The screenshot is shown with the final terms of reference in appendix 1.

19/11/2018

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to the National Theatre for Wales on 06/12/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires Flintshire County Council to ensure that the text of each page of its website is available and fully functional in Welsh, and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language. Although the Council has since taken steps to rectify the errors that appeared on the 'Do it Online' page, it acknowledges that English only sections did appear on the web page at the time the complainant submitted his complaint. In failing to ensure that the 'Do it Online' web pages on the Council's website were fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language on those pages, the Commissioner is of the view that the Council has failed to comply with standard 52.

Standard 56: Standard 56 requires Flintshire County Council to ensure that the interface and menus on every page of its website are in Welsh. Although the Council has since taken steps to rectify the errors that appeared on the 'Do it Online' page, it acknowledges that English only headings did appear on the web page at the time the complainant submitted his complaint. In failing to ensure that the interface and menus were in Welsh on the 'Do it Online' page of the Council's website, the Commissioner

is of the view that the Council has failed to comply with standard 56.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Flintshire County Council has failed to comply with standards 52 and 56.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Flintshire County Council has failed to comply with standards 52 and 56.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 79(1) (b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure

1. Flintshire County Council must review the arrangements and guidance in place for publishing and uploading text on the website in order to comply with standard 52.
2. Flintshire County Council must take steps to remind staff within the individual services who are responsible for content appearing on the Council's website, of the requirements of standard 52.

Standard 56 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 79(1) (b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure

3. Flintshire County Council must review the arrangements and guidance in place for publishing and uploading text on the website in order to comply with standard 56.
4. Flintshire County Council must take steps to remind staff within the individual services who are responsible for content appearing on the Council's website, of the requirements of standard 56.
5. Flintshire County Council must provide

sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1-4. Timetable: Within 12 weeks of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Flintshire County Council on 19/11/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

On 18/10/2017 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. Submitting the complaint, the complainant provided copies of correspondence between the complainant and the Council between April 2016 and October 2017 regarding the lack of Welsh language content on the website and the Twitter and Facebook accounts.

16/11/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires Pembrokeshire County Council to ensure that the text of each page of its website is available and fully functional in Welsh, and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language. The Council acknowledges that the Visit Pembrokeshire website is in English only since its creation in 2014, and has stated that the website will not be bilingual until October 2018. The Council stated that there were technical and budgetary reasons why the website had not been developed bilingually. Standard 56: Standard 56 requires Pembrokeshire County Council to ensure that the interface and menus on every page of its website are in Welsh. The Council has stated that the www.visitpembrokeshire.com website is in English only and that the work of creating a bilingual website will not be finished until October 2018. The Council noted that there were technical and budgetary reasons why the website had not been developed bilingually. Standard 58: Standard 58 requires Pembrokeshire County Council to

Pembrokeshire
County Council

treat the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language when using social media. The Council has been required to comply with the standard since 30 March 2016. In response to the evidence notice, the Council has stated that it has not yet undertaken bilingual Social Media activities and that Welsh language content will not be developed on the Visit Pembrokeshire Twitter and Facebook accounts until the bilingual Visit Pembrokeshire website is completed. The Commissioner is of the opinion that anything is preventing the Council from ensuring that messages posted on the Visit Pembrokeshire Twitter and Facebook accounts are available in Welsh.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Pembrokeshire Council has failed to comply with standards 52, 56 and 58.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Pembrokeshire Council has failed to comply with standards 52, 56 and 58.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 79(1) (b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure 1. Pembrokeshire County Council must take steps to ensure that the Visit Pembrokeshire website functions bilingually in full and that the Welsh language content corresponds fully to the English language content.

Timetable: By 31 January 2019 Standard 56 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 79(1) (b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure 2. Pembrokeshire County Council must take steps to ensure that the Visit Pembrokeshire website interface and menus are available in Welsh. Timetable: By 31 January 2019 Standard 58 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 79(1) (b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure 3. Pembrokeshire County Council must prepare an action plan to ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language on its social media. The action plan must address: □□the Council's policy for posting content on social media □□procedures for posting Welsh language content on social media □□staff awareness of Welsh language standard requirements in relation to posting content on social media □□Staff training Timetable: The Council should prepare the initial draft action plan within 8 weeks of the date of the decision notice in this case, with the aim that the Council fully complies with Standard 58 by 31 January 2019. 4. Pembrokeshire County Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1-3. Timetable: 28 February 2019

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Pembrokeshire Council on 16/11/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Denbighshire
County Council

On 25 April, 2018 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions set out in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid. The complaint related to Denbighshire County Council's (the Council's) parking services. The complainant claimed that the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language on Council parking tickets. The complainant alleged that: a) the Welsh text appeared in lower case letters with the English in capital letters; b) the Welsh font size was smaller; c) the word 'Date' appeared above the Welsh word 'Dyddiad' d) the word 'Fee' appeared in English only. The complainant also claimed that a 'post-it' note had been placed on a pay and display ticket machine in one of the Council's car parks in April 2018. According to the complainant's evidence, this note read: "Please use other machine other side of stairwell."

15/11/2018

Commissioner's findings

Having considered the evidence presented to the Commissioner in light of the interpretation given in part 3 paragraph 29 of the Welsh Language Regulations of treating the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the parking ticket treats the Welsh language less favourably in terms of the visual presentation of the material. Although the same information is conveyed in both languages, with the Welsh language largely preceding the English, it is clear that the English text is more prominent on the parking ticket. The English text appears in capital letters with the corresponding Welsh either in lower case letters or in a smaller font. There is no Welsh word for 'fee' on the ticket. This also means that the ticket treats the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. Standard 61: The standard is clear that the Council must ensure that the text of any temporary sign it erects is displayed in Welsh. A temporary sign – in this case a 'post it' note – displaying English only text was placed on a pay and display ticket machine.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Denbighshire County Council has failed to comply with standards 48 and 61 in this case.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Denbighshire County Council has failed to comply with standards 48 and 61.

Statement on the further action

Standard 48 Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure 1. Denbighshire County Council must ensure that parking tickets produced by it comply with standard 48. 2. Denbighshire County Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 1. Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination. Standard 61 Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure 3. Denbighshire County Council must ensure that any temporary signs it erects on pay and display machines comply with standard 61. 4. Denbighshire County Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 3. Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Denbighshire County Council on 15/11/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

On 9 May 2018 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to a sign erected in Rhosddu Park, Wrexham, displaying rules for using the park. The complainant alleges that the sign includes a map with English only street names.

12/11/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 61: Standard 61 requires the Council, when it erects a new sign or renews a sign (including temporary signs), to ensure that any text displayed on the sign is displayed in Welsh (whether on the same sign as it displays corresponding English language text or on a separate sign). The body must not treat the Welsh language text less favourably than the English language text on those signs. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public regarding a sign erected in Rhosddu Park, Wrexham displaying rules for park users. The complainant alleges that the sign includes a map with English only street names. Having considered the evidence of the Council and the complainant, the Commissioner believes that the Council has erected a sign where not all of the text was displayed in Welsh, contrary to the requirements of the standard.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council Council has failed to comply with standard 61 in this case.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 61.

Statement on the further action

Standard 61 – Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 (3) (b) of the Welsh Language Measure 1.

The Sports
Council for
Wales

On 13/12/2017 the Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleged that the Sports Council for Wales (Council), posted the majority of its Twitter messages in English only on its @sport_Wales account.

12/11/2018

Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that all of the text displayed on the sign in question in Rhosddu Park, Wrexham appears in Welsh in accordance with the requirements of standard 61. 2. Wrexham County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 1. Timetable: Within 60 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 12/11/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Commissioner's findings

Standard 54: Standard 54 requires the Council to treat the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language when using social media. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that the Council posted the majority of its Twitter messages in English only on its @sport_Wales account. In light of the original complaint and the evidence sent to the Commissioner by the Council, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the Council has failed to comply with standard 54.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that the Sports Council for Wales has failed to comply with standard 54.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Sports Council for Wales has failed to comply with standard 54.

Statement on the further action

Standard 54 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77(3)(b) of the Welsh Language Measure 1. When the Council produces text to be published on its social media, any message in English must also be published in Welsh. The meaning of the Welsh text must convey what is explained by the English text; 2. The Council must adopt a formal procedure to ensure that it acts in such a way as to comply with standard 54; 3. The Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has carried out enforcement action 1 and 2. Timetable: Within 90 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to the Sports Council for Wales on 12/11/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 16/02/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to temporary signs which had been erected on the junction between Price Road and Rhosddu Road, Wrexham, during road works. The complaint was accompanied by photographs of a sign with English only text and a sign with the Welsh language text displayed below the English text.

8/10/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 61: Standard 61 requires the Council, when it erects a new sign or renews a sign (including temporary signs), to ensure that any text displayed on the sign is displayed in Welsh (whether on the same sign as it displays corresponding English language text or on a separate sign). The body must not treat the Welsh language text less favourably than the English language text on those signs. The Commissioner received a complaint relating to temporary signs which had been erected on the junction between Price Road and Rhosddu Road, Wrexham during road works. The complaint was accompanied by photographs of one sign with English only text. Following full consideration of evidence provided by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner concludes that an English only sign was erected on the junction between Price Road and Rhosddu Road, Wrexham on 16 February, 2018. Standard 62: Standard 62 requires the Council, when erecting or renewing a sign (including temporary signs) that conveys the same information in Welsh and in English, the Welsh language text is positioned so that it is likely to be read first. The Commissioner received a complaint regarding temporary signs which had been erected on the junction between Price Road and Rhosddu Road, Wrexham during road works. The complainant provided a photograph of a sign where the Welsh language text was displayed below the English language text. Following full consideration of evidence provided by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner concludes that a sign where the Welsh language was less likely to be read first

was erected on the junction between Price Road and Rhosddu Road, Wrexham on the 16 February, 2018.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standards 61 and 62.

Statement of further action

Following the Commissioner's determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standards 61 and 62, no further action was taken in this case.

Statement on the further action

No further action was taken because on 20 June 2018, the Commissioner determined in another investigation into the Council's compliance with these standards (investigation reference CSG237). Following the determination that the Council had failed to comply with standards 61, 62 and 63 in that investigation, the Commissioner imposed 9 enforcement actions on the Council which requires them to take action to ensure compliance with the standards.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 08/10/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Vale of
Glamorgan
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 19/10/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that a webpage was only available in English on the Vale of Glamorgan Council website. The complainant was unhappy that he was being directed to an English page after inputting his postcode on the Welsh page of the website in order to find out more information on waste and recycling.

26/9/2018

Commissioner's findings

The Commissioner conducted investigations (CSG116, CSG142, CSG143, and CSG148) into the alleged failure by the Vale of Glamorgan Council to comply with Welsh language standards relating to the Council's website. On 1 March 2017, the Commissioner determined that the Vale of Glamorgan Council had failed to comply with standards 47, 48 and 52. The decision notice required the Vale of Glamorgan Council to take steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure. The Council was required to comply with these steps by 27 April 2017. This complaint raises suspicions of failure to comply with the following steps noted in the decision notice. Enforcement Action 1 The enforcement action placed on the Vale of Glamorgan Council on 1 March 2017, required the Council to take steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure. The enforcement action required the Council to ensure its compliance with standard 52 in relation to the text of each webpage, the way in which the Welsh pages on its website function, and to treat the Welsh language no less favourably than English on its website by 27 April 2017. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public on 02/11/2017 alleging that a webpage was only available in English on the Vale of Glamorgan Council website. As the complaint highlights the fact that not every page on the Council's website was available in Welsh on a date after 27 April 2017, the Council had not succeeded to comply with the first enforcement action. Enforcement Action 2 The enforcement action required the Council to review the website's editorial procedures and processes as the Council updates its website or

makes changes to the website. The Council provided instructions to staff regarding the need for each page of the website to be available in Welsh together with instructions on how to achieve this. The Council implemented the enforcement action by reviewing the website's editorial procedures and processes through making changes to the system of uploading information onto the website, providing instructions and guidance for staff on how to do so.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Vale of Glamorgan Council has failed to comply with enforcement action 1 in this case. The Commissioner determined that the Council had not failed to comply with enforcement action 2.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Vale of Glamorgan Council has failed to comply with enforcement action 1.

Statement on the further action

Requirement to take further steps in accordance with section 77(b) of the Welsh Language Measure 1. The Vale of Glamorgan Council must undertake a full review of the Council's website to ensure that each page of the website complies with standard 52 in relation to the text of each web page, the way in which the Welsh pages on its website function, and to treat the Welsh language no less favourably than English on its website. The review should include checking the language of each section of the

website, assessing each step in the editorial processes of the website, checking the adequacy of that stage, considering any risk factor, and putting steps in place to mitigate any risk. 2. The Vale of Glamorgan Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 1. Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Vale of Glamorgan Council on 26/09/2018

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 22/02/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to the Council's web pages:
<http://planning.wrexham.gov.uk/Planning/Ig/GFPlanningWelcome.page?lang=cy>. These pages list current planning applications within the Borough and enable the public to search for applications, view any documents relating to an application and to make

20/9/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires a body to ensure that all pages on its website are available and are fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language on those pages. The Commissioner received a complaint alleging that there is an error on the Welsh language pages of the Council's planning application website. As a result of the error, it is not possible for the public to look at or download documents relating to a specific planning application. This error does not exist on the English language pages of the website in question. Following full consideration of the evidence provided by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner has found that there is an operational error on the Welsh language pages of the Council's planning application

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

comments or challenge an application. The complainant alleges that there was an error on the Welsh language page of this website. When attempting to view documents relating to any application, an error message appears ("bu gwall mewno!"). The complainant claims that this error does not occur when using the English language page.

website leading to a situation whereby the Welsh language service provided is less favourable than the corresponding English language service.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 52.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 52.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – requirement to prepare an action plan in accordance with section 77(3)(a) of the Welsh Language Measure Wrexham Council Borough Council must prepare an action plan for the purpose of preventing the continuation of the failure to comply with standard 52 on the Council's planning application web pages. Timetable: The Council must submit a draft action plan within 90 days of receiving the final decision notice.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 20/09/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 7/12/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that signs with English only text had been erected within the People's Market car park, Wrexham. The complainant alleged that signs had been erected on 7 December 2017 noting "This car park closes at 9pm Thursday".

19/9/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 61: Standard 61 requires that the Council, when erecting or renewing a sign (including temporary signs), ensures that any text on the sign is displayed in Welsh (either on the same sign as the corresponding English text or on a separate sign). The Council must not treat the Welsh language text any less favourably than the English text on these signs. The Commissioner received a complaint alleging that a sign with English only text was erected within the car park at the People's Market, Wrexham on 7 December 2017. Following full consideration of the evidence of the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner finds that a sign with English only text was erected on 7 December 2017 within the car park of the People's Market, Wrexham.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 61.

Statement of further action

No further action was taken in respect of the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 61.

Statement on the further action

This is due to two reasons. The first reason is that the Council has taken steps to remove the sign complained about on the day that it became aware that a complaint had been presented to the Commissioner, erecting a bilingual sign that does comply with the requirements of

the Welsh language standards. The second reason is that the Commissioner has recently completed an expansive investigation into the compliance of the Council with the standards relating to signs that are displayed by the Council that is standards 61, 62 and 63. Following the Commissioner's determination in that investigation, the Commissioner imposed 9 enforcement action that require steps to be taken in order to comply with the standards.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 19/09/2018

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 19/10/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the Council had failed to provide a link on its website to Welsh language versions of meeting documents and the Council's annual monitoring report. In addition, the complainant alleged that there was English text on the Welsh pages of the Council's website.

10/9/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires a body to ensure that all pages on its website are available and are fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language on those pages. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that links to specific documents on the Council's website directed the user to English language documents only, and also that not all pages on the Council's website were available in Welsh. In considering the evidence received, the Commissioner concludes that not all pages on the Council's website are available in Welsh. The Council recognises that some pages are available in English only and are not fully functional in Welsh. Standard 55: Standard 55 requires a body, if it has a Welsh language web page that

Newport City Council

corresponds to an English language web page, to state clearly on the English language web page that the page is also available in Welsh. It also requires that a direct link to the Welsh page is provided on the corresponding English page. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that links to specific documents on the Council's website directed the user to English language documents only, and also that not all pages on the Council's website were available in Welsh. In examining the evidence, the Commissioner concludes that the Council, where it has a page in Welsh on its website which corresponds to a page in English, has noted that the page in English is also available in Welsh. The Council has also used a 'Cymraeg' link to take users directly to the corresponding page in Welsh.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standards 52 and 55.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Newport City Council has failed to comply with standards 52 and 55.

Statement on the further action

Standard 52 – Requirement to take action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure
Enforcement action 1: Newport City Council must complete the translation of pages on its corporate website in order to ensure: a) that all pages are available in Welsh

b) that links provided on Welsh language pages direct the user to information or documents in Welsh. Timetable: Within 6 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 2: Newport City Council must ensure that Welsh language pages are available on its website hosted by modern.gov. Timetable: Within 9 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 3: Newport City Council must confirm in writing to the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has undertaken enforcement actions 1 and 2. Timetable: 20 working days following undertaking the final enforcement action . Standard 55 – recommendations in accordance with section 76 of the Welsh Language Measure As Newport City Council undertakes enforcement action 2 - it should ensure that it complies in full with the requirements of standard 55 by making it clear on English web pages that there is a corresponding page in Welsh and by providing a direct link to that corresponding page.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Newport City Council on 10/09/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Neath Port
Talbot County
Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 22/11/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in

28/8/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 59: Standard 59 requires the organisation to ensure that they reply in Welsh to any message sent in Welsh to the organisation via social media if the message is one that requires an answer. The complainant sent a

section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the complainant contacted the Council on Twitter on 25 June 2017 to inform the Council of refuse. The complainant did not receive a reply and contacted the Council again on 6 August to ask why he had not received a reply and questioned whether it was because she contact the Council in Welsh. The complainant did not receive a response until 22 November 2017. The response was in English.

Twitter message in Welsh to the Council's Welsh language Twitter account and did not receive a response for over three months. The response received was in English. As the Council responded in English to a message in Welsh on Twitter, the Council did not comply with standard 59 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 59.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 59.

Statement on the further action

Requirement 1 Standard 59 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure Undertake a review of the effectiveness of the new arrangements in order to ensure that the procedure for responding to messages in Welsh works as the Council intended. The above is to be actioned within 28 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination. Requirement 2 Standard 59 – requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that Requirement 1 has been

completed. The above is to be actioned within 20 days of completing Requirement 1.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council on 28/08/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 19/07/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an alleged failure by the Council to use the Welsh version of the complainant's address in its correspondence with him via email. The complainant received an email from the Digital Services team on 17/07/2017 quoting his home address and customer number. The complainant's address had been written in English on the email, e.g. the use of 'Wrexham' instead of 'Wreccsam'. The complainant alleges that he had asked Wrexham County Borough Council on several occasions to use the Welsh

23/8/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 6: Standard 6 requires Wrexham County Borough Council to ensure that it does not treat the Welsh language version of correspondence less favourably than the corresponding English language version. I received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that he had received correspondence that included the English version of his home address when it should have been provided in Welsh. I have considered all the evidence presented by both parties regarding the requirements of the standard, and I find that the Council have acted contrary to the requirements of standard 6.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 6.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

version of his address in their correspondence with him.

Statement on the further action

Wrexham County Borough Council must take steps to ensure that Welsh versions of addresses are used on Welsh language correspondence sent by the Council in order to comply with standard 6. Timetable: Within 28 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 23/08/2018

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Torfaen County
Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 31/12/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that Torfaen County Borough Council was publishing more information on its English language Twitter account than its Welsh language Twitter account. According to the complainant, there were approximately 15 Twitter messages on the English language account between 20 and 31 December 2017 that were not

23/8/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 58: Standard 58 requires Torfaen County Borough Council to not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language when using social media. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that Torfaen County Borough Council was publishing more information on its English language Twitter account than its Welsh language Twitter account. According to the complainant, there were approximately 15 Twitter messages on the English language account between 20 and 31 December 2017 that were not published on the Welsh language account. In light of the original complaint and the evidence sent to the Commissioner by Torfaen County Borough Council, the Commissioner believes that the Council has failed to comply with standard 58.

published on the Welsh language account.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner determines that Torfaen County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 58.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Torfaen County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 58.

Statement on the further action

Torfaen County Borough Council must take the following steps in order to ensure compliance with standard 58: 1. When the Council publishes its own information or shares information by other people on its social media accounts, whether in Welsh, in English or bilingually, it must ensure that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language. 2. When the Council plans Welsh language, English language and bilingual messages to be published automatically (or otherwise) on its social media accounts, for example, before a holiday period, it must not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. 3. The Council must establish a clear system which explains how the content and consistency of its Welsh language social media accounts are checked. 4. Torfaen County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1-3. Timetable: Within 90 days from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

Powys County Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 10/11/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that English text appears on the Welsh language side of Powys County Council's 'Councillors and meetings' page and following the link to the Council's Committees, this leads to an English only page.

30/7/2018

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Torfaen County Borough Council on 23/08/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Commissioner's findings

Standard 52: Standard 52 requires Powys County Council to ensure that the test of each page of its website is available and fully functional in Welsh, and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language, The Commissioner received a complainant by a member of the public alleging that, when visiting the Council's 'Councillors and meetings' page and following the link to the Council's committees and meetings, this leads to an English only page. The Commissioner had considered all of the evidence presented by the complainant and the Council. Not all of the text on the Council's Welsh language website pages was available in Welsh, and the pages were not fully functional in Welsh. As a result, the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language. The Commissioner therefore finds that Powys County Council acted in contrary to the requirements of standard 52.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 52: Powys County Council has failed to comply with standard 52 in this instance.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Powys County Council's failure to comply with standard 52.

Statement on the further action

Powys County Council must review its arrangements for publishing information on its website via modern.gov. Powys County Council must implement the findings of the review in order to ensure that complies with standard 52 when publishing information on its website via modern.gov. Powys County Council must conduct a campaign to raise awareness amongst members of staff responsible for its website content of the requirements of the Welsh language standards with regard to websites and online services. This action must be taken within 90 days of publishing the final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Powys County Council on 30/07/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Welsh Ministers

The Commissioner received a complaint on 17/08/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an

26/7/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 4: Standard 4 requires Welsh Ministers to ensure that, when sending correspondence to several persons, a Welsh language version of the correspondence is sent at the same time as the English language version. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that he had received an English only version of the Dysg

English only version of the 'Dysg' newsletter received by the complainant via email on 17/08/2017. The complainant alleges that he had previously asked for Welsh language emails from Welsh Ministers.

newsletter on 17/08/2017. Standard 37: Standard 37 requires Welsh Ministers to ensure that it produces publicity material in Welsh, without treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that he did not receive a Welsh language version of the Dysg newsletter on 17/08/2017.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 4: Welsh Ministers have not failed to comply with standard 4 in this instance. Standard 37: Welsh Ministers have not failed to comply with standard 37 in this instance.

Statement of further action

Recommendation was given to Welsh Ministers following the determination that they have not failed to comply with standard 4.

Statement on the further action

Standard 4 – Recommendation I recommend that Welsh Ministers review the way in which they send Welsh and English Dysg newsletters. The Welsh Language Commissioner's Bilingual Design guide gives guidance to organisations on the best practice when designing and publishing Bilingual material. See the link to the guide is below:

<http://www.comisiynyddygyymraeg.cymru/English/Publications%20List/CYG1754%20Canllaw%20Dylunio%20ENGLISH.pdf>

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Welsh Ministers on 26/07/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Commissioner's findings

Requirements to take steps i, ii and iii placed on the Council on the 01/06/2017: The requirement to take step (i) required Cardiff City Council to ensure that the agendas and minutes of management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public are produced and published in Welsh in order to comply with standard 41 by 30 June 2017. The requirement to take step (ii) required Cardiff City Council to ensure that PDF versions of the agendas and minutes of management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public are produced and published in Welsh on the Council's website in order to comply with standard 48 by 30 June 2017. The requirement to take step (iii) required Cardiff City Council, where there are English language PDF versions of agendas and minutes of management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public, to ensure that these documents are also available in Welsh, at the same time and in the same location as the English versions in order to comply with standard 48 by 30 June 2017. In July 2017, the Council published PDF versions of agendas and minutes of the Public Protection Committee meetings and Planning Committee meetings on the Council's website in English before publishing them in Welsh. The Council accept that the failure did

The Commissioner received a complaint on 04/07/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that Cardiff City Council continued to place English only Council meeting agendas and papers on their website. The complaint referred to the Public Protection Committee agenda and papers for 4 July 2017, and the agenda and papers of the Planning Committee for 12 July 2017.

12/7/2018

Cardiff Council

occur and explain that this failure was due to an administrative irregularity. The research conducted by my officers also shows that it appears that the Council is now in compliance with the above requirements. The Commissioner therefore accept the view of the Council that there are arrangements in place to comply in the majority of cases. However, the Commissioner notes that the complaint has highlighted that the arrangements in place at the time of the complaint allowed errors to occur at times. In publishing agendas and minutes of the Council's Public Protection Committee meeting and the Planning Committee meeting in English before publishing the corresponding Welsh versions, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the Welsh language documents have been treated less favourably. Therefore, the Commissioner must conclude that Cardiff City Council have failed to act on the requirement to take step (i) (ii) and (iii) to prevent the continuation or repetition of the failure to comply with standard 41 and 48. Requirements to take step iv placed on the Council on the 01/06/2017: The Council published PDF versions of agendas and minutes of the Public Protection Committee meetings and Planning Committee meetings on the Council's website in English without publishing them in Welsh in July 2017. Step (iv) requires the Council, when publishing documents in Welsh and English, to ensure that there is no difference in terms of the format of both versions. In this case, the Council failed to publish a Welsh version of the document, and therefore it is not possible to determine whether there was a difference in the format of the Welsh and English versions as no Welsh version was published. Requirements to take step v placed on the

Council on the 01/06/2017: Step (v) required the Council to ensure that English language PDF versions of the agendas and minutes of management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public clearly state that they are also available in Welsh. The research conducted by my investigation and compliance officer showed that PDF versions of minutes and papers for the Public Protection Committee and the Planning Committee were published in English. The statement 'This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg' was included at the bottom of the documents in question. In including the statement 'This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg' on the English documents, the Council have acted in accordance with the requirements of step (v). Requirements to take steps vi, vii and viii placed on the Council on the 01/06/2017: The requirement to take step (vi) required the Council to ensure that the text of each agenda incorporated on the website was available in Welsh. The requirement to take step (vii) required the Council to ensure that all Welsh language pages relating to Council committee meetings on its website are fully functional in order to comply with standard 52. The requirement to take step (viii) required the Council to ensure that any text available in English is also available in Welsh so that the Welsh language page is not treated less favourably than the corresponding English language page. The Commissioner has already noted in paragraph 3.11 that she accepts the view of the Council that there are now effective arrangements in place and that the examples in question were an exception. However, by failing to ensure that the text and content of the Welsh

pages corresponded to the English pages in relation to committee meetings on the Council's website on the 4th and 6th of July, Cardiff City Council failed to comply with the requirement to take step (vi), (vii) and (viii).

Requirements to take step ix placed on the Council on the 01/06/2017: The requirement to take step (ix) required the Council to ensure that its staff is aware of the guidance and arrangements in place for producing (and publishing) agendas and minutes in Welsh. On 4 July and 6 July 2017, Cardiff City Council published the text of the agendas for the Public Protection Committee and the Planning Committee meetings on the Council's website together with the meeting documents in English without displaying corresponding text or corresponding documents in Welsh. No evidence was provided of the steps taken by the Council in terms of informing or reminding staff of the guidance or arrangements in place for producing and publishing meeting agendas and minutes. As a result, I am not satisfied that Cardiff City Council have taken the steps noted in step (ix) to prevent the failure to comply with the Welsh language standards.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Cardiff City Council has failed to comply with the requirements to take steps i, ii, iii, vi, vii, viii and ix.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Cardiff City Council's failure to comply with the requirements to take steps i, ii, iii, vi, vii, viii and ix.

Statement on the further action

Cardiff City Council must undertake a full review of their arrangements for producing and publishing agendas, minutes and papers in relation to management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public in accordance with standards 41, 48 and 52. Timetable: Within 6 weeks of issuing the Commissioner's final determination Cardiff City Council must take steps to remind or raise awareness of staff who are: i) responsible for producing and publishing documents such as agendas and minutes of management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public, ii) responsible for monitoring and updating content on the Council's web pages, in relation to management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public of the guidance and arrangements in place in relation to producing and publishing text for Cardiff City Council's website or agendas, minutes and papers in relation to management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public in order to ensure compliance with standards 41, 48 and 52. Timetable: Within 8 weeks of issuing the Commissioner's final determination Cardiff City Council must put measures in place to ensure robust administrative processes are in place within the Council to ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language in producing and publishing web page text, agendas, minutes and papers in relation to management board or cabinet meetings, and/or meetings open to the public. Timetable: Within 10 weeks of issuing the Commissioner's final determination Cardiff City Council must submit a report to the Welsh

Language Commissioner reporting on the implementation of steps 1, 2 and 3. The report should include completion dates, evidence of how the steps have been implemented and any further action required. Timetable: Within 12 weeks of issuing the Commissioner's final determination

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Cardiff City Council on 12/07/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 03/06/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an alleged failure by Ceredigion County Council to provide a Welsh medium tutor to deliver harp lessons to primary school pupils.

3/7/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 84: Standard 84 requires Ceredigion County Council, if it offers an education course that is open to the public, to offer that course in Welsh until an assessment undertaken in accordance with standard 86 shows that the course is not required in Welsh. In its evidence, the Council stated that it has not undertaken an assessment of the need to deliver the course in Welsh, therefore the exception is not relevant to this investigation. In its evidence, the Council has noted that not all instrumental courses provided are offered in Welsh. The Council has produced a draft action plan showing the steps it intends to take in order to develop provision. The action plan has not been finalised and was not in operation during the investigation. In offering harp lessons that are open to the public and not offering all of those in Welsh, Ceredigion County Council has failed to comply with standard 84. Standard 86: The requirement in standard 86 to assess the need to offer an education course in Welsh is not

Ceredigion
County Council

relevant unless a course is developed. The Council has explained that the harp lessons are continuous courses held on an annual basis. As a result, the duty to comply with standard 86 does not apply in this case. Therefore, there has been no failure to comply with standard 86 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

The Commissioner determined that Ceredigion County Council has failed to comply with standard 84 in this case.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Ceredigion County Council has failed to comply with standard 84.

Statement on the further action

The Council must prepare an action plan showing the steps it will take to comply with standard 84 in relation to harp lessons. The Council should prepare the initial draft action plan within 12 weeks of publishing the final report. I will act in accordance with section 80 of the Welsh Language Measure in relation to the action plan. I have provided the Council with an advice document which will assist it in preparing the action plan. Timetable: Within 12 weeks of publishing the Commissioner's final determination which is by 25/09/2018.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Ceredigion County Council on 03/07/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Powys County Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 06/08/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that an English only bus timetable at Trefonnen bus stop on Temple Street, Llandrindod Wells. The complainant alleged that the timetable, which was placed on a post near the bus stop, was in English only and stated that it was sponsored by Powys County Council. The complainant saw the timetable there sometime during the last week of July 2017.

3/7/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 38: Standard 38 requires Powys County Council to ensure that any material it displays in public is displayed in Welsh and to treat the Welsh language no less favourably than the English language if an English language version of that material is displayed. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that there was an English only bus timetable on Temple Street, Llandrindod Wells. The Council has confirmed that the timetable was in English only on the date the complaint was received. Standard 69: Standard 69 requires the Council to ensure that any official notice it publishes or displays is published or displayed in Welsh. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that there was an English only bus timetable on Temple Street, Llandrindod Wells. Given all of the evidence presented by the organisation, which confirms that the timetable was displayed in English only and that the Welsh language was therefore treated less favourably than the English language, the Commissioner finds that Powys County Council has failed to comply with standard 69 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: The Commissioner determined that Powys County Council has not failed to comply with standard 38.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Powys County Council's failure to comply with standards 38 and 69.

Statement on the further action

Standard 38: I require Powys County Council to take the following steps in order to ensure that all timetables displayed in public are available in Welsh. The Council will be required to confirm that the work of updating the timetables has been completed within the timetable noted below. The Council must make arrangements to ensure that any new software it uses which enables it to deliver services also enables it to comply with the Welsh language standards. Timetable: Within 90 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination. Standard 69: I require Powys County Council to ensure that it complies with standard 69 by checking that all bus timetables in the Council's catchment area are displayed in Welsh, thereby ensuring that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language. Timetable: This action must be completed by the 31/10/2018.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Powys County Council on 03/07/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure as the

29/6/2018

Commissioner's findings

The Commissioner is of the opinion that the standards require organisations to possess strong corporate

Commissioner suspected that Wrexham County Borough Council (the Council) was not complying with some of the standards with which it has a duty to comply. The standards under consideration are 61, 62 and 63. The Commissioner opened an expansive investigation in order to consider the general arrangements adopted by the Council when erecting signs both at a corporate and departmental level. The basis for the Commissioner's suspicion that there were insufficient arrangements in place to guarantee that the Welsh language was receiving appropriate treatment on signs, was the receipt of a number of complaints.

processes in order to support departments and services to comply successfully. In the absence of such arrangements, departments and services will interpret the standards differently to each other. They will come to their own conclusions regarding the need to comply, and adopt a department approach towards failure to comply and tolerance of failure. In such situations, there is a high risk of misinterpreting the requirements of standards, or of a failure to operate in a way that complies with the requirements. The Commissioner acknowledges that the Council has developed some guidance and has taken some steps to promote the requirements of the standards amongst staff. However, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the steps taken have not been sufficient, in particular in the context of erecting signs to ensure full understanding of the impact of the standards and the culture change required in order to comply with them. In order for an organisation to comply with the standards, strategic and corporate leadership is essential. This means the Council must establish a culture where there is zero tolerance of such failures. It appears that English only signs and signs that treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language continue to be erected by different departments of the Council, and that this is happening when erecting both permanent and temporary signs. Following consideration of the evidence received, the Commissioner concludes that Wrexham County Borough Council has erected signs without ensuring that the text on that sign is displayed in Welsh.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standards 61, 62 and 63: The Commissioner determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has not failed to comply with standard 61, 62 and 63.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Wrexham County Council's failure to comply with standards 61, 62 and 63.

Statement on the further action

Enforcement action 1 Wrexham County Borough Council must take steps to: Ensure that any text displayed on signs that have been erected since 30 March 2016, (including temporary signs) is displayed in Welsh (either on the same sign that displayed the corresponding English text or on a separate sign). Ensure that the Welsh text is not treated less favourably than the English text, if the text is displayed in Welsh and English. Timetable: Within 6 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 2 The Council must take steps to improve its corporate arrangements by: Producing clear guidance and procedures for staff for designing, producing and approving new signs or signs that are being renewed Create a programme of activities in order to raise staff awareness of the requirements of standards 61,62, and 63. Timetable: Within 6 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 3 Wrexham County Borough Council must: Develop an inspection and review process to check all signs that have been since the imposition date to ensure

that they comply with the Welsh Language standards. □

The Council must replace any signs that do not comply within 3 months of their discovery. Timetable: Within 6 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 4 The Council must give publicity to its failure by publishing this report in a prominent place on its website and include an item regarding the investigation in its news section. Timetable: Within 28 days of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 5 Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that any text on signs erected since the imposition date of standard 62 displays any Welsh text in a position whereby it is most likely to be read first. Timetable: Within 6 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 6 Wrexham County Borough Council must review their Transport and Highways contracts with third parties that erect signs on their behalf, in order to ensure that correct reference is made to the requirement to comply with standards relating to displaying signs. Timetable: Within 3 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforcement action 7 Wrexham County Borough Council must create processes and guidance for the use of staff to ensure that Welsh language text on signs is accurate in terms of meaning and expression. Timetable: Within 6 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination. Enforced action 8 Wrexham County Borough Council must present the report on this investigation to a relevant scrutiny Committee of the Council. Timetable: Within 6 months of the date of publication of the Commissioner's final

			<p>determination. Enforced action 9 Wrexham County Borough Council must provide written evidence that gives sufficient assurance to the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1-8. Timetable: Within 20 working days of completing the final enforcement action.</p> <p>Decision notice given The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 29/06/2018.</p> <p>Appeals made to the tribunal No appeal was made to the Tribunal.</p>
<p><u>Newport City Council</u></p>	<p>The Commissioner received a complaint on 20/07/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an alleged failure by Newport City Council to comply with the Welsh Language Standards in erecting signs in car parks and other public areas across the county. It is alleged that the Council:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Erected a sign on the mayor's parking bay displaying the text 'This bay is reserved for the Mayor's car' without any corresponding Welsh text • Erected a sign at the councillor's car park at 	<p>19/6/2018</p>	<p>Commissioner's findings Standard 61: Standard 61 requires Newport City Council, when they erect a new sign or renew a sign (including temporary signs), to ensure that any text displayed on the sign is displayed in Welsh (whether on the same sign as the corresponding English language text or on a separate sign). During July 2017, Newport City Council displayed 6 signs displaying English text without any corresponding Welsh text in public areas within the county. In presenting its response to the evidence notice, the Council states that the signs in question were erected before the imposition day of Standard 61, which was 30 March 2016. The Commissioner therefore conclude that Newport City Council was not required to comply with the Welsh language standards when the Council erected the signs in question.</p> <p>Commissioner's determination</p>

Newport's Civic Centre displaying the text 'Parking for Councillors Only' and 'No stopping' without any corresponding Welsh text • Erected a sign at Coed-Melyn Park, Newport displaying the text 'Keep to Footpath Uneven Ground' without any corresponding Welsh text. • Erected a sign opposite the St Julian's Inn Tavern displaying the text 'Motor Vehicles Prohibited' without any corresponding Welsh text • Erected a sign at Piper Close, St Julians displaying the text 'No Hunting Allowed on this Land' without any corresponding Welsh text • Erected a sign at the Allt-yr-ynn Nature Reserve displaying the text 'Allt Yr Yn Nature Reserve – 1.2 miles' without any corresponding Welsh text. Images were provided of the signs subject to the allegation.

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 61: The Commissioner determined that Newport City Council has not failed to comply with standard 61 in this case.

Statement of further action

No further action was taken in respect of the determination that Newport City Councils have not failed to comply with standard 1.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Newport City Council on 15/06/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 16/06/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that some consultations on the English pages of Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) website

18/6/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 44: Standard 44 requires an organisation to produce consultation papers that are available to the public, in Welsh. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that some consultations on the English pages of Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) website were not available in Welsh. In considering the evidence received from the complainant and Wrexham County Borough Council, the Commissioner is of the opinion that the consultation papers were produced in Welsh by the

were not available on the Welsh pages. Links were provided by the complainant to the relevant pages. It appeared that there were fewer links to consultations on the Welsh pages than there were on the English pages and the closing dates for some of the consultations had expired.

Council, in the sense that they were prepared for the purpose of publication. Standard 52: Standard 52 requires organisations to ensure that every page on its website is available and fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably on those pages. Wrexham County Borough Council has been subject to standard 52 since 30 March 2016. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that some consultations on the English pages of Wrexham County Borough Council's (the Council) website were not available on the website's Welsh pages. In considering the evidence received from the complainant and Wrexham County Borough Council, the Commissioner is of the opinion that some consultations published on the Council website's English pages were not included on the website's Welsh pages on 18 December 2017 and as a result the Welsh pages were not complete and fully functional, contrary to the requirements of standard 52.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 44 - The Commissioner determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has not failed to comply with standard 44. Standard 52 - Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 1 - The Commissioner determined that Wrexham County Borough Council have failed to comply with standard 52.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Wrexham County Council's failure to comply with standard 52

Statement on the further action

Wrexham County Borough Council must review its procedure for uploading and deleting contents on corresponding Welsh and English pages of its website, and take appropriate steps to minimise the risk of failure to comply with Standard 52 as a result of human error. Timetable: Within 90 days of the publication of the Commissioner's decision notice for the case

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on 18/06/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Flintshire
County Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 03/10/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation the complainant telephoned Flintshire County Council's main telephone line on 3 October 2017 and chose the Welsh language service by pressing option '2'. The complainant

15/6/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 11: Standard 11 requires Flintshire County Council to deal with a call in Welsh once it is aware that the person wishes to receive a Welsh language service over the phone, transferring the call to a member of staff who is able to deal with the specific subject matter in English only where necessary. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that they were unable to receive a Welsh language service on two occasions during October 2017. They alleged that they had to terminate calls after experiencing delays and a failure to answer the calls after choosing a Welsh language service. After considering evidence

alleged that they waited 20 minutes for someone to answer the call. The complainant decided to call the main number again, choosing the English option by pressing option '1', and that this call was answered immediately. The complainant requested that the call be transferred to a Welsh speaker but the responder replied that the Welsh speaker was on holiday. The complainant provided additional information on 30 October 2017, stating that they had also tried to telephone the Council on that day and that there was no Welsh language service available. The complainant alleges that they telephoned the Council three times during October 2017 and that, each time, the Council offered that a Welsh speaker would call them back, but the complainant call was not returned on any of these occasions.

submitted by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner is of the opinion that there is sufficient information that the Council does not provide an adequate Welsh language service on its main telephone line, resulting in members of the public giving up on waiting for a Welsh language service. Therefore, the Council is not meeting the requirements of the standard to provide a Welsh language service to all those who wish to receive it. Standard 15: Standard 15 requires a body to ensure that performance indicators for dealing with telephone calls do not set measures which would treat telephone calls made in Welsh less favourable than calls made in English. Flintshire County Council has been subject to this standard since 30 March 2016. In considering evidence received by Flintshire County Council, the Commissioner concludes that the body's performance indicators for dealing with telephone calls set the same measures for dealing with Welsh and English language calls, and that this meets the requirements of the standard. Standard 17: Standard 17 requires a body to inform the caller when a Welsh language service will be available if no Welsh language service is available on the relevant telephone number or line. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public who had been informed by the Council that there was no Welsh language service available. They did not receive any information about when a Welsh language service would be available and although the Council offered to provide a Welsh language service via call-back, they did not receive that call. In considering evidence provided by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner notes that the Council does not inform the public when a Welsh language

service will be available as a matter of course if that service is not available.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 27 - The Commissioner determined that Welsh Ministers have not failed to comply with standard 27.

Statement of further action

Standard 11: The Commissioner determined that Flintshire County Council have failed to comply with standard 11. Standard 15: The Commissioner determined that Flintshire County Council have not failed to comply with standard 15. Standard 17: The Commissioner determined that Flintshire County Council have failed to comply with standard 17.

Statement on the further action

Standard 11: Further action was taken in respect of Flintshire County Council's failure to comply with standard 11. Standard 15: A recommendation was given to Flintshire County Council in respect of the determination that they had not failed to conform with standard 15. Standard 17: Further action was taken in respect of Flintshire County Council's failure to comply with standard 17.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Flintshire County Council on 15/06/2018

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Natural Resources Body for Wales

The Commissioner received a complaint on 08/11/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the complainant sent an email in Welsh to Natural Resources Wales on 17 October 2017 and 5 November 2017 and that he received an email response in English only on 7 November 2017.

15/6/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires a body to reply in Welsh if it receives correspondence from a person in Welsh (if an answer is required). A body does not have to do so in situations where a person has confirmed that there is no need to reply in Welsh. Natural Resources Wales has been subject to this standard since 25 January 2017. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that they had received a response in English only to an email enquiry sent in Welsh. Having considered evidence from the complainant and Natural Resources Wales, the Commissioner concludes that a response in English only was sent to the complainant despite having made his enquiry in Welsh. This is contrary to the requirements of the standard. Standard 7: Standard 7 requires bodies to state in correspondence, and in publications and official notices that invite persons to respond to them or to correspond with them, that they welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh, that they will respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. Natural Resources Wales has been subject to standard 7 since 25 January 2017. When responding to an email enquiry in English only, the body did not include a statement welcoming correspondence in Welsh, stating that it would respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh would not lead to delay. In considering evidence from the complainant and Natural Resources Wales, the Commissioner concludes that it did

not include a statement in its email correspondence in accordance with the requirements of standard 7.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 1: Natural Resources Wales has failed to comply with standard 1 in this instance. Standard 7: Natural Resources Wales has failed to comply with standard 7 in this instance.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Natural Resources Wales' failure to comply with standard 7.

Statement on the further action

Natural Resources Wales must ensure that it includes a statement on all correspondence in accordance with the requirements of standard 7. Timetable: Within 28 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Natural Resources Wales on 15/06/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Welsh Ministers

The Commissioner received a complaint on 16/06/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure.

13/6/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 109: Standard 109 requires Welsh Ministers to ensure that any policy published in relation to absence from work is published in Welsh. The Commissioner

The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the Welsh version of the Welsh Government's absent from work policies, do not correspond with the English versions. The complainant alleges that following the relevant links to the Welsh version of the policies leads to a document that provides a summary of the policy's main principles, but that following the relevant links to the English version of the policies leads to an absence from work policy document including a guidelines and procedures document.

received a complaint from a member of the public who alleges that not all documents relating to absence from work policies are available in Welsh. The complainant alleges that the policies themselves are available in Welsh but that the explanatory documents, the guidance and procedures, are only available in English and not in Welsh. Welsh Ministers provide bilingual policies but the guidance and procedures documents which expand on implementing the policies further are only available in English. The Commissioner believes that this is contrary to the requirements of standard 109.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 109: The Commissioner determined that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 109.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Welsh Ministers' failure to comply with standard 109.

Statement on the further action

Welsh Ministers must comply fully with standard 109 by ensuring that all documents relating to absence from work policies are available in Welsh. Timetable: Within 6 months of publishing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Welsh Ministers on 13/06/2018.

Torfaen County
Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 22/08/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that Welsh version of Torfaen County Borough Council's official app contains linguistic errors on the. The complainant alleges that the app is full of Welsh language errors.

13/6/2018

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Commissioner's findings

Standard 57: Standard 57 requires Torfaen County Borough Council to ensure that any app it publishes is fully functional in Welsh and that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public who alleges that there are linguistic errors on the Welsh version of Torfaen County Borough Council's official app. The complainant alleged that the app was full of Welsh language errors. In this case, the Commissioner believes that Torfaen County Borough Council has not complied with the requirements of standard 57. The evidence presented shows that the Welsh language has been treated less favourably than the English language.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 1 - The Commissioner determined that Torfaen County Borough Council have failed to comply with standard 57.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Torfaen County Borough Council's failure to comply with standard 57.

Statement on the further action

Torfaen County Borough Council must ensure that it complies with standard 57 by preparing an action plan to

ensure that the Council's main app functions fully in Welsh and that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language. The action plan should: a) include a timetable for undertaking the various steps involved in creating and publishing accurate Welsh language text b) designate a responsible person to undertake the steps c) identify the budget and resources required Torfaen County Borough Council should prepare the initial draft action plan within 3 months of the date of the decision notice. I will act in accordance with section 80 of the Welsh Language Measure in relation to the action plan.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Torfaen County Borough Council on 13/06/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Welsh Ministers

The Commissioner received a complaint on 16/06/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the complainant received an English only letter from the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales in response to Welsh language

7/6/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires Welsh Ministers to reply in Welsh, if an answer is required, unless the person has indicated that there is no need to reply in Welsh. In this case, the complainant sent an e-mail to CSSIW in Welsh and received a reply in English. As Welsh Ministers had sent an English language letter to the complainant in response to a Welsh language e-mail, CSSIW, and thereby Welsh Ministers, have failed to comply with standard 1 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

correspondence. The complainant was also unhappy that the Inspectorate had used the English name of the town in his address rather than the Welsh name that he had used in correspondence.

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 1 - The Commissioner determined that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 1.

Statement of further action

No further action was taken in respect of Welsh Ministers' failure to comply with standard 1.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Welsh Ministers on 07/06/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 24/05/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the Welsh language was not heard (with the exception of the opening sentence) and no translation facilities were available during an evening arranged by Farming Connect (funded by the Welsh Government) at Wrexham on 23/05/2017.

24/5/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 27 - Standard 27 requires a body to ask persons invited to a meeting whether they wish to use the Welsh language at the meeting. In my opinion, the email sent to 6,000 addresses informing recipients of the event, and asking attendees to identify their preferred language, constituted an invitation to the event at Wrexham Glyndŵr University on 23 May 2017. In response to the Commissioner's question, "Were the persons invited asked whether they wished to use the Welsh language during the meeting?", "yes" was the answer provided, and Welsh Ministers noted that 234 people informed them that they wished to use Welsh at the meeting. Standard 27A - Standard 27A requires a body which invites attendees to a meeting to arrange a simultaneous translation service from Welsh to English if at least 10% of those invited have

Welsh Ministers

informed them that they wish to use Welsh at the meeting. An email invitation was sent to around 6,000 people, and 234 said that they wished to use Welsh at the meeting. Welsh Ministers did initially arrange translation provision for the meeting, but it was decided to proceed with the meeting without using the equipment as there were not enough headsets for all those wishing to use them. As a result of the decision made, there was no translation service available at the meeting. Standard 33 - Standard 33 requires a body to ensure that a simultaneous translation service is available where a meeting is open to the public, with those in attendance orally informed that they are welcome to use Welsh and that a simultaneous translation service is available. The event in question was not open to the public. An email was sent to Farming Connect members informing them of the event. The following criteria had to be met before attending: i) registering with Farming Connect in advance; (ii) registering for a specific date and location offered; (iii) being a main partner in the business; and (iv) stating their preferred language.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 27 - The Commissioner determined that Welsh Ministers have not failed to comply with standard 27. Standard 27A - The Commissioner determined that Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 27A. Standard 33 - The Commissioner determined that Welsh Ministers have not failed to comply with standard 33.

	<p>Statement of further action Further action was taken in respect of Welsh Ministers' failure to comply with standard 27A</p> <p>Statement on the further action Standard 27A - Welsh Ministers must produce a guide for the use of third parties acting on their behalf regarding compliance with the Welsh language standards when arranging meetings held on their behalf. Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.</p> <p>Decision notice given The Decision Notice was given to Welsh Ministers on 24/05/2018.</p> <p>Appeals made to the tribunal No appeal was made to the Tribunal.</p>
<p><u>Cardiff Council</u></p> <p>The Commissioner received a complaint on 29/01/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to the fact that the address on a bilingual Council Tax bill was in English only.</p>	<p>Commissioner's findings Standard 6 - Standard 6 requires a body to ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language when producing correspondence. City of Cardiff Council has been subject to this standard since 31 March 2016. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public which claimed that the Welsh language was being treated less favourably than the English language on standard council tax correspondence as the addresses on the correspondence are in English only. In considering the evidence received from the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner</p>

21/5/2018

concludes that English only addresses were included on standard council tax correspondence.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 6 - City of Cardiff Council has failed to comply with standard 6

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of City of Cardiff Council's failure to comply with standard 6.

Statement on the further action

Standard 6 - City of Cardiff Council must prepare an action plan that will demonstrate what steps they will take in order to comply with standard 6. This requirement is enforced in accordance with section 80 of the Welsh Language Measure. Timetable: Within 3 months of publishing the final determination of the Commissioner.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to the City of Cardiff Council on 21/05/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Caerphilly
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 03/08/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure.

15/5/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 4 - Standard 4 requires the Council to send a Welsh language version of correspondence at the same time as the English language version if that

The complainant was unhappy after receiving an English only email with the title "Summer Reading Challenge at your local library". The contents of the email explained that it was the Library's first news bulletin. The email referred to the summer reading challenge and provided information on library services.

correspondence is being sent to several persons. The Council sent the library service's first news bulletin to several persons in English only. As the Council did not send a Welsh language version at the same time as the English language version when it emailed the bulletin to several persons, it did not comply with standard 4 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 4 - The Commissioner determined that Caerphilly County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 4.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Caerphilly County Borough Council's failure to comply with standard 4.

Statement on the further action

Standard 4 - Caerphilly County Borough Council must ensure that when it sends bulletins to several persons via email, it sends the Welsh language version at the same time as any English language version within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Caerphilly County Borough Council on 15/05/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Rhondda Cynon
Taf County
Borough Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 30/08/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to letter that the complainant had received from Rhondda Cynon Taf Pension Fund. The standard letter dated 'August 2017' provided information and encouraged the complainant to join 'My Pension On-line', an online service to manage their pension. The complainant alleged that they had received this standard letter in English only.

9/5/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 4 - Standard 4 requires a body to send a Welsh language version of correspondence that it sends to several persons. The body must also ensure that a Welsh language version of the correspondence is sent at the same time as any English language version. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that they had received a letter in English only from the Council. It appears that the letter's subject matter was standard text and text that would be used for several persons. Following full consideration of the evidence provided by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner is of the view that the Council sent a letter to several persons in English only, contrary to the requirements of standard 4.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 4 - The Commissioner determined that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council did not comply with standard 4.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council's failure to comply with standard 4.

Statement on the further action

Standard 4 - Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council must conduct a review of each standard letter it sends to several persons in order to ensure a Welsh version is available. The Council must ensure that any

correspondence sent to several persons is sent in Welsh at the same time as any English version. Timetable: Within 6 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council on 09/05/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 26/05/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that the complainant contacted Powys County Council's Highways department to say that the condition of one of their roads had caused damage to his car. He sent the Council a bill for the repair of his car and the complainant received a letter in Welsh from the Council to say that they had passed on the bill for the damage to the car to their department dealing with vehicle damage. Following this, the complainant received a letter in English only by the Loss

1/5/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1 Standard 1 requires the Council, or any party acting on behalf of the Council, to respond in Welsh to correspondence in Welsh. A company acting on behalf of Powys County Council sent an English only letter to the complainant in response to a letter in Welsh only. As the complainant received an English only response to his correspondence in Welsh, the Council did not comply with standard 1 in this case. Standard 7 Standard 7 requires Powys County Council to include a statement explaining that they welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh, that they will respond to correspondence in Welsh, and that corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. In this case, the company acting on behalf of Powys County Council was expected to include this statement on their correspondence. In this case, the letter. As the letter to the complainant did not include the required statement, Powys County Council did not comply with standard 7 in this case.

Powys County Council

Adjusters, Gallagher Bassett. The letter included the following: "Please be advised that we are appointed by Powys County Council as claims handlers therefore all correspondence should be addressed to ourselves in relation to this matter from hereon." "We would be grateful if you could correspond with us in English as we are claims handlers / insurers based in England and are not Welsh speaking"

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 1 The Commissioner determined that Powys County Council did not comply with standard 1. Standard 7 The Commissioner determined that Powys County Council did not comply with standard 7.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Powys County Council's failure to comply with standards 1 and 7.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1 and 7 When sub-contracting, Powys County Council must instruct third parties on how to comply with the Welsh language standards. Powys County Council must complete these steps within 3 months of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Powys County Council on 01/05/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The British
Broadcasting
Corporation

The Commissioner received a complaint on 03/07/2018 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint alleges that a person on behalf of the BBC called at his home

26/4/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 5 Standard 5 requires the BBC to provide a Welsh version of correspondence when corresponding with a person if they don't know whether a person wishes to receive correspondence in Welsh. The complainant did not receive a Welsh version of the correspondence left at

address in Cardiff on 26/06/2017 and left correspondence in English only regarding a television licence.

his home in Cardiff on 26/06/2017. The BBC noted that the correspondence is available in Welsh but the newly recruited enquiry officer had used copies given to him during the training course. "Standard letters (where we don't know if the person wishes to receive correspondence from us in Welsh or English) are sent bilingually to postcodes... in Wales". The BBC noted that they conducted a risk review and are putting an action plan in place to resolve any areas of potential risk.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined that the BBC failed to comply with standard 5.

Statement of further action

No further action was taken in respect of the BBC's failure to comply with standard 5.

Statement on the further action

The Commissioner was of the opinion that the BBC have taken sufficient action to ensure that the failure is not likely to happen again.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to the BBC on the 26/04/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham
County Borough
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint on 17/05/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complainant alleged that tickets printed by Wrexham Borough County's pay and display parking machines included errors in the Welsh language. The complainant noted specifically that the word 'Bwrdeistref' had been incorrectly spelled - as 'bwrdeisdref' and in addition, the complainant alleged that there were language errors in the adverts on the back of tickets and that the Welsh language was being treated less favourably than the English language on the adverts due to use of a smaller font for the Welsh text, and that the English language text in the adverts was in bold print.

25/4/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 48 requires a body not to treat any Welsh language version of a document being produced less favourably than the English language version of that document. Wrexham County Borough Council has been subject to this standard since 30 March 2016. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that there were spelling errors and language errors in the Welsh text appearing on pay and display tickets and that the adverts on the back of the tickets treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. Following consideration of the evidence presented by the complainant and the Council, the Commissioner concludes that the pay and display tickets include spelling errors and that text on these tickets treats the Welsh language less favourably than the English language through the use of different

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: The Commissioner determined that Wrexham County Borough Council has failed to comply with standard 48 in this instance. The basis for the determination is that the Welsh text on the pay and display tickets is treated less favourably than the English text.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of Wrexham County Borough Council failure to comply with standard 48.

Statement on the further action

Wrexham County Borough Council must ensure that the text on pay and display tickets does not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language. Wrexham County Borough Council must rectify the language errors that appear on the pay and display tickets. These steps must be completed within 90 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Wrexham County Borough Council on the 25th of April 2018

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint on 20/07/2017 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint met the conditions in section 93 of the Welsh Language Measure, and was therefore a valid complaint. The complaint related to an allegation that only English language content is found on the @Powysarchives and @Sport_Powys Twitter accounts and the Chwaraeon Sport Powys Facebook account. The complainant also alleges that they did not receive a response to a Welsh language email sent to the cwsmer@powys.gov.uk email address on 06/06/2017 and again on

25/4/2018

Commissioner's findings

Standard 1: Standard 1 requires Powys County Council to respond in Welsh to correspondence received in Welsh. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that they did not receive a response to an email written in Welsh and sent to the Council. In considering the evidence received from the complainant and Powys County Council, the Commissioner believes that Powys County Council has failed to comply with standard 1. Standard 58: Standard 58 requires Powys County Council to ensure that it does not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language when using social media. The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public claiming that no Welsh language messages were to be seen on the @Powysarchives and @Sport_Powys Twitter accounts nor the Sport Powys Facebook account. 3.37 In

Powys County Council

15/07/2017, informing Powys County Council that only English language content was to be found on the Twitter and Facebook accounts.

considering the evidence received from the complainant and Powys County Council, the Commissioner believes that the Council has failed to comply with standard 58 in this case.

Commissioner's determination

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: Standard 1 - The Commissioner determined that Powys County Council have failed to comply with standard 1. Standard 58 - The Commissioner determined that Powys County Council have failed to comply with standard 58.

Statement of further action

Further action was taken in respect of the determination that Powys County Council have failed to comply with standards 1 and 58.

Statement on the further action

Standard 1: Powys County Council must ensure that its policy on responding to correspondence makes it quite clear that the Welsh language should be treated no less favourably than the English language. Powys County Council must provide its staff with guidance and support in relation to how to respond to correspondence in Welsh in accordance with its policy on responding to correspondence and in accordance with the requirements of standard 1. The Council should take these steps within 28 days of the date of publication of the final investigation report. Standard 58: Powys County Council must prepare an action plan to ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language on

its social media platforms. The action plan must address:

- the Council's policy for posting content on social media
- procedures for posting Welsh language content on social media
- staff awareness of Welsh language standard requirements in relation to posting content on social media
- staff training

The Council should prepare the initial draft action plan within 3 months of the date of the decision notice in this case. I will act in accordance with section 80 of the Welsh Language Measure in relation to the action plan .

Decision notice given

The Decision Notice was given to Powys County Council on 25/04/2018.

Appeals made to the tribunal

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.